
BEST BOOKS ON
SPIRIT PHENOMENA

1847- 1925

Notes Describing Representative Volumes
Belief-Unbelief-Disbelief

HENRIETTA LOVI

BOSTON

1925

COPYRIGHT 1925 BY RICHARD G. BADGER

ALL RIGHTS RESERVED

PRINTED IN THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

THE GORHAM PRESS. BOSTON, MASS. U. S. A.

CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
I INTRODUCTORY	5
II PIONEER WRITERS	9
III FROM THE STANDPOINT OF PSYCHICAL RESEARCH	14
IV LODGE AND DOYLE	19
V WITH THE SPIRITUALISTS	25
VI OPPONENT AND DIVERGENT OPINIONS	33
VII THE INTERESTED CLERGY	38
VIII AUTOMATIC WRITINGS, SPIRIT LETTERS, PLANCHETTE AND OUIJA BOARD MESSAGES	45
IX CRITICAL OBSERVERS	58
X IN VARIED ASPECTS	64
XI ANOTHER VARIED GROUP	71
XII BOOKS TO SIT UP ALL NIGHT TO READ	79
XIII A TRIO OF TREMENDOUS WORKS	83
SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF SPIRIT PHENOMENA	89
INDEX TO AUTHORS AND TITLES	91

BEST BOOKS ON SPIRIT PHENOMENA

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTORY

A teacher placed before her class of small children a colored picture, showing an organ-grinder entertaining a little crowd of juveniles with his music and monkey.

"Tell me what you see," was her instruction.

The replies finally included several clear descriptions of the scene as a whole, and one lad, despite stumbling phraseology, deduced the corollary that children return to their play with larger enjoyment after a street organ has enlivened the neighborhood.

But one little fellow rather disdainfully voiced the information that he did not care for the picture; and the class answers further comprised one indifferent "I don't know,"—several boisterous exclamations of "Monkey!" —and (from the tiniest member present) the unelaborated statement, "Moosics."

A school official present during this session, happened to be an investigator of psychic science.

"The thought struck me," he said later, after describing the class exercise, "that adult minds meet the idea of spirit communication in a series of reactions very similar to those of the children at their picture lesson."

Considering this analogy—it is of course recognized that antagonism and indifference are commonly met where the suggestion is broached of penetrating after-death conditions.... Further, a few minds grasp only that psychic investigation may provide a veritable

monkey-show of entertainment.... Others, discovering therein an agreeable explanation of death's mystery, find solace—but only that.... Proof of future existence is viewed by a certain percentage of persons as having important scientific value, or at any rate as being worthy of rational examination.... Finally there are those who step forth from the seance room so uplifted by the experience that they proclaim the knowledge of spirit communication as a harbinger of moral regeneration and expanded human life.

Whether it may be worth while to study psychic science to the point of attaining a nicely-adjusted focus regarding such subjects, is of course a matter for individual judgment. But no educated person should remain entirely uninformed of the general status of psychic investigation, and unaware of the position taken by philosophy and religion in regard to belief in spirit manifestation. Protestant, Catholic or unaffiliated thinker should be able to refer to the strongest of the shafts directed against the presumption of communication with those called dead; and should be familiar With the best of the arguments in behalf of a common meeting-ground for psychical researcher, church adherent and unattached reasoner.

In recent years the printed output on psychical subjects has been enormous. Contact with psychic phenomena at second-hand has become possible through the extensive published records of psychic societies, and the writings of persons stirred to share with others the marvel or the comfort they have discovered. That these books often repeat one another, covering endless pages with unimportant dialogue or rhapsodizing, might be the sole conclusion drawn from hurried scrutiny. But rejection of the whole as inconsequential meets answer in the number of people of distinguished achievement who have

interested themselves in psychic investigation, and a closer inspection of the spiritistic bookshelves discloses not only quantity but quality, the writings often bearing impress of literary mastership.

Notwithstanding the extent and character of this class of literature, no formal descriptive catalogue or survey giving a bird's-eye view of the chief books on spirit survival, has up to now been presented. Proper selection along these lines has puzzled librarians, and a comprehension of psychical science has been outside of the province of the general bookseller. Therefore choice from even well-stocked shelves has not been simple for a prospective purchaser or a library patron. Descriptive notes have been lacking, to guide decision as to which of such volumes might be liked for actual ownership, what ones possibly would please as gifts, or what would provide an evening's diversion.

The present outline has been compiled from the viewpoint of a library worker and a student of spirit survival, in an effort to indicate noteworthy and representative volumes in the English language dealing with that branch of psychical science concerned with proofs of continuity of life after physical death—with spirit communication—spirit manifestation—spirit phenomena. (No consideration has been given to books whose entire content bears only remote relation to the specific subject of proof of after-death existence, although a number of the entries comprise, in addition to pertinent sections, material not vital to the essential topic). The attempt has been made to shape a basic statement for use in approaching this class of literature, and as a result approximately one hundred books have been listed, with some information as to their scope and manner. The record comprises claims of proponents, adverse discussions, and

the unbiased views of observers in no alliance with either the defense or the opposition.

Selection of a limited number of books on any differentiated subject is confronted by lack of balance, since fertile aspects of the matter in hand are likely to be responsible for many similar works. Therefore, while entry in the present list is often intended to bespeak merit, such entry is not intended to score against volumes omitted.

CHAPTER II

PIONEER WRITERS

While accounts of angel visitants and other marvelous phenomena may be found in the literature of every age, a revival of attention to such subjects sprang up in various countries about the middle of the nineteenth century—in the late forties. In America at that time, and somewhat later in England, the interest in spirit manifestation rose to a degree sufficient to warrant book publication, and during the subsequent twenty years a considerable number of volumes came from press.

Although many of these early avowals of experience lie parallel to the declarations of later writers, yet the first books were issued in small editions, and most of the volumes which appeared prior to 1870 have vanished from booksellers' shelves. But a few of the pioneer efforts came from men so prominent in affairs that their words carried especial weight, and no record of the literature of spirit communication could overlook mention of these books, although most of them are now inaccessible except in the older and larger libraries.

As early as 1854 John W. Edmonds, a judge in the higher courts of the State of New York, collaborated with George T. Dexter, a physician, in presenting a very dignified and earnest record of their personal seance experiences. The unequivocal title of this book was "Spiritualism," and it comprised over five hundred pages, including an appendix of experiences contributed by Nathaniel P. Tallmadge, a former United States Senator and Governor of Wisconsin. Not only were Edmonds

and Dexter able to state what they had observed as apparently resulting from the mediumship of others, but Doctor Dexter himself developed the faculty of writing tinder spirit control, the messages coming in a far more vigorous and forceful manner than is habitual to the twentieth century "automatic writer."

To place such a record before the public at the risk of scorn and disparagement required a fine courage on the part of men who had attained prestige in the eyes of the world. Even in the present era of freedom of thought, a shrug is often the response to any suggestion of interest in spiritism, while a decade or so ago the discussion of such topics was likely to be carried on behind one's hand. So that, in thinking back to the year 1854, it is not difficult to sense something of the strength of conviction and whole-hearted sincerity animating judge Edmonds and his associates in publishing the findings of their seance-room investigations.

The present generation will recall the name of Robert Hare only as associated with the invention of the oxy-hydrogen blowpipe. But as professor of chemistry at William and Mary College and at the University of Pennsylvania, Hare had made a name for himself, and his skill in the construction of various appliances having laboratory value was known over the scientific world.

Notwithstanding his busy life, he found time to investigate psychic phenomena, and in this field also he experimented with contrivances of his own invention, which he had designed to test the genuineness of mediumship. One of the first to bring the experience of science to bear, upon psychic investigation, Hare in 1856 assembled the results of his research in a volume entitled "Spiritualism scientifically demonstrated."

As champion of a cause little understood, Hare's painstaking experimentation in this direction brought only harsh criticism. In place of the honor reaped from his activity in departments of physical science, chagrin and disappointment came upon him when he attempted to explain his position regarding spiritualism. Yet although he issued no further books of like character, the bitter and unfair comment to which Robert Hare was subjected failed to stir him in the least degree from the original stand which he had taken in relation to the truth of spirit communication.

To this early time also belong the volumes proceeding from the mediumistic faculties of Andrew Jackson Davis. Discourse and dissertation of a nature stated to have been entirely beyond the scope of Davis's limited education, were spoken by him while supposedly under control of higher intelligences. From 1845 to 1847 Davis delivered over 150 lectures. It was arranged that these be taken down and compiled by amanuenses. Besides a number of less extensive books, the chief volumes due to the psychic faculties of this man are "The principles of nature, her divine revelations, and a voice to mankind," published in 1847, and "The great harmonia, being a philosophical revelation of the natural, spiritual and celestial universe," originally published in 1851.

These works are obtainable in reprinted editions brought out in recent years. Their subject matter deals with facts in science and philosophy in a way to tend toward suggestions for the betterment of mankind. Precious though these stupendous books of lectures may be to the confirmed spiritualist (the "Principles of nature" ran through thirty-four editions in thirty years!) it is no libel to class them as difficult and dry. With the idea of bringing their principal teachings into a form

available and comprehensible to a larger circle of readers than the books themselves are likely to be, more than one digest or compendium has been prepared from the works of Andrew Jackson Davis, and may be obtained from publishers specializing in spiritualistic literature.

Robert Dale Owen, a son of the social reformer, was another distinguished individual who put into print his acceptance of the reality of spirit manifestation. Owen was a veritable dynamo of energy. Born in Scotland, he became a United States citizen whose record in the State Legislature of Indiana was such that he advanced to serve the Nation as Member of Congress. Turning his attention to spiritualistic representations, he entered into their study with heart and soul, as was his nature to do in whatever line of thought he contacted. Thus when he embodied in book form his conclusions concerning spirit phenomena, he was qualified to deal with his subject. Other books had appeared under the authorship of Owen, but nothing he wrote was more impressive or lasting than his volume entitled "Footfalls on the boundary of another world," which was issued as early as 1859. "Debatable land between this world and the next," published more than ten years later, was also a work of importance.

As has been remarked, early books concerned with spirit phenomena were less numerous in England than in America. However, a British work which still survives in large book collections, was constructed by William Howitt in, 1863.

William Howitt and his wife, Mary Howitt, had put together many a compilation useful in extending the knowledge of ordinary readers, and in a two-volume work entitled "The history of the supernatural in all ages and nations," Howitt completed a voluminous

survey of the history of spirit manifestation. Being himself convinced of the possibility of communicating with the so-called dead, this author has scattered throughout his pages conclusions which, after years of close observation, psychical science is now offering as part of its portion. This extensive work of William Howitt, therefore, in such libraries as possess it, maintains a present-day value as a reference source.

Again in England, among the first books bearing upon spirit manifestation was the famous "Night side of nature," by Catherine Stevens Crowe. On account of its character this book is especially mentioned in the present outline under the chapter heading "Books to sit up all night to read." It is here alluded to for the reason that the original edition appeared in 1848, one of the earliest dates of publication of works on like subjects. This book is not of the sort to carry the staunch attitude of a defender of a cause. Nevertheless, to so earnest a student and author as Mrs. Crowe psychical science of the present time is indebted, as well as to those other early writers who interrupted their careers as professional men, scientists or statesmen to proclaim, in the face of the world's derision, what they felt was an important truth.

CHAPTER III

FROM THE STANDPOINT OF PSYCHICAL RESEARCH

Because the idea of spirit communication so frequently was defended by persons of very definite accomplishment in their own fields of endeavor, a committee was appointed in 1869 by the Dialectical Society of London to investigate spiritistic claims. Having reported upon about fifty seances observed, this committee then desisted, with some members convinced and some dissenting as to the reality of spirit phenomena. But later certain scholarly minds determined to enter upon a study of spiritualistic theories which should be more formal and more consistently pursued than any previous examination of these matters. Therefore, in 1882, Professor William Barrett, of the University of Dublin, with other men connected with that university and with Cambridge, founded the British Society for Psychical Research. The purpose of this society was to make "an organized and systematic attempt to investigate that large group of debatable phenomena designated by such terms as mesmeric, psychical, and spiritualistic." The deliberate methods of this body of scholars, prior to the time when spirit manifestation gained credence, are indicated by remarks recorded after the organization had been active for more than a dozen years. Professor William James, president of the Society for Psychical Research in 1896, stated substantially in an address before his colleagues at that time, that the scientific mind was disposed to accredit to psychic research that it had arrived at nothing more than certain presumptions; although in the

same speech this Harvard professor admitted his private conviction of the truth of certain manifestations.

Ever since its founding, the British Society for Psychical Research has continued to conduct investigations and to publish in its yearly Proceedings the extremely scholarly and careful reports of its findings. These reports may be consulted in large libraries and may be purchased, in whole or in part, from the offices of the association. Naturally, however, the content is detailed and voluminous, and the wants of the average reader will be answered without resort to these volumes, since the experience of the Society for Psychical Research has been drawn upon for material throughout many of the books hereafter to be mentioned in the present list.

The life work of Professor Barrett, named above as one of the founders of the Society for Psychical Research, lay along the lines of physical science, and for eminence in this field he was honored with knighthood. His interest in psychical research, however, never relaxed, and when in 1917 he published a book dealing with that subject, Sir William Fletcher Barrett was able to offer to the world a clear, brief survey of the knowledge gained by the Society for Psychical Research up to that time.

The book bears the attractive title "On the threshold of the unseen," its subtitle elucidating that it is "an explanation of the phenomena of spiritualism and of the evidence of survival after death." In its particular province this volume renders as important a service as anything its distinguished sponsor may have given to science in general.

Two years after the organization of the British Society for Psychical Research, or in 1884, an American branch of the society was formed. Discontinued as such in 1905,

this section was then organized under the leadership of James H. Hyslop, as the American Society for Psychical Research, Section B of the American Institute for Scientific Research. The Proceedings of this society cover several volumes, the work of course tending in a direction similar to that of the British organization. One of the notable contributions of the American group is a lengthy and important consideration of a case of dissociated personality.

Hyslop remained in constant close connection with the American society until his death in 1920; and in 1918, one year later than the appearance of Sir William Barrett's book "On the threshold of the unseen," James H. Hyslop presented a volume of like nature entitled "Life after death."

For concise yet thoroughly readable general surveys of the subject of spirit manifestation from the standpoint of psychical research, there are no better books than these two at present obtainable. Not only with a wealth of experience did each of these men proceed, but also with a highly cultivated sense of proportion, clearness and strength. When Doctor Hyslop went onward into the existence whose reality he had so perseveringly striven to prove, he had fittingly crowned his efforts by the completion of this great book—"Life after death"—and had enriched the literature of psychical science by one of its finest volumes. Likewise, the Barrett book is of outstanding importance to its subject—a treatise wherein the tremendous earnestness of the author can not fail to impress. The mood of the latter volume is that of unhurried deliberation; while at no time complex or difficult for the ordinary reader, these chapters sound the depths of psychical study with seriousness and power. Hyslop's work, in contrast, moves in resilient bounds, striking goal with brisk, assured blows.

One or both of these books should be available in every English or American public library or library branch having five thousand or more volumes. These are representative statements, and their substance should form a part of the information of every adult of ordinary education. Further, for any persons without access to public library shelves, the price placed upon these books is not prohibitive, and the mental return is large. Each gives the net, essential results of years of investigation—the very cream of all that many scholarly men had gained by cooperative studies.

An outline of psychical research, previously presented by Barrett, had performed a service at the time of its publication, although in beauty and fire "On the threshold of the unseen" outshines any earlier efforts of this author. Doctor Hyslop also, with a liking for expression through print, and a facility in shaping crisp paragraphs, had put forth other books; indeed the volume "Life after death" comprises some portions expanded from earlier productions, chiefly from this author's "Psychical research and survival." A Hyslop work of later publication, "Contact with the other world," consists of unconnected chapters, and while comprising certain accounts of experience new to psychical knowledge and of great value, the record as a whole is not as essential to psychical literature as is the volume "Life after death."

A small volume presenting a digest of the activities of the Society for Psychical Research during a period of twenty years (1882-1902) was prepared by E. T. Bennett, who served as assistant secretary of the society during this time. The book is entitled "Psychic phenomena; a brief account of the physical manifestations observed in psychical research, with facsimile illustrations of thought transference drawings and automatic writing." While

this is not the only work based upon this writer's contact with psychical science, it is his most comprehensive presentation, being a clear resume bringing the reader to that point of view where it had been Mr. Bennett's privilege to stand; and his record, for the time it covers, has a permanent usefulness.

CHAPTER IV

LODGE AND DOYLE

These two eminent Englishmen are in no way coupled together in partnership for psychic investigation, yet because both have made lecture tours through America in defense of the fact of spirit communication, and because certain of the books of Sir Oliver Joseph Lodge and Sir Arthur Conan Doyle came forth contemporaneously in the catalogues of spiritistic literature, their names link together in the mind of the average United States citizen.

Probably no one person at any time has done more to diffuse the idea of proving after-death existence than has Sir Oliver Lodge. When a noted physicist—knighted because of achievement in scientific fields—expresses his conviction of the truth of communication with the so-called dead, naturally a far greater number give attention than would heed all the hue and cry that could be raised by a host of obscure individuals.

It is true that other renowned scientists, years before Lodge appeared in this arena, had interested themselves in matters of spirit manifestation, and some of them had openly accepted spirit phenomena as evidential. In 1871 William Crookes published in the *Quarterly Journal of Science* the results of his psychic investigations—results more astounding than any accomplished by the later tests of Lodge. Crookes, too, had won a high place in the scientific world, although knighthood was not conferred upon him until a later time. His pronouncements were recognized as having definite value. Thus his spiritistic findings

became forever a part of the important history of Psychical research, and are frequently recounted in the literature of the subject. Likewise, Alfred Russel Wallace, world-known for his contributions to scientific knowledge, had boldly announced his acceptance of similar psychical theories. In 1873 an article by Wallace on spiritualism appeared in the *Fortnightly Review*, this account being later incorporated in his book entitled "On miracles and modern spiritualism." And it is of interest to note that in this scientist's autobiography (written more than thirty years after the publication of his now nearly forgotten early statements) he has accorded no slighting or niggardly space to mention of spiritualism, but stands by his original conclusions in strongly worded terms.

Coming a bit later, Lodge found a path less overgrown with prejudice than if these preceding fellow-scientists and also the British Society for Psychical Research had beaten no trail. He could profit not only from his private researches but by association with the Society for Psychical Research, and his first volume on spirit survival was more extensive than the essays of Wallace or the magazine articles of Crookes, which latter when compiled in book form had reached this wider mode of publication through effort of others than Crookes himself. But Lodge had been in the habit of sharing his scientific acquirement through the printed page, and similarly he gave out his psychical knowledge as he found it. Nor did he desist with a single expression of his views. His hammer blows followed one another at intervals, giving worldwide exploitation to his convictions.

In 1909, then, appeared his initial volume in relation to matters psychical—"The survival of man; a study in unrecognized human faculty." This is not simple reading. The chapters are brusque statements of a scientific mind.

the voice of duty proclaiming its understanding of truth, rather than fluent outpourings from a pen rushing on for love of shaping sentences or enamored of a vision. The book is a worthy member upon any library shelf, and to psychical literature it is a notable acquisition.

Such a presentation had no quality to affect the popular mind to an appreciable extent, nor was Lodge apparently concerned with any object other than to make serious record of his standpoint. But in 1913 newspaper headlines throughout Great Britain and America carried the name of Sir Oliver Lodge, when, as president of the British Association for the Advancement of Science, he addressed that assembly upon "Continuity." Since this address could be given in a column or so of a daily news sheet, its compelling and pointed argument in behalf of the reality of after-death existence reached a wider range of readers than had any similar statement up to that time. Lodge, doubtless, had merely undertaken to explain his attitude to his colleagues; his utterance touched the limits of the English-speaking world.

Then in the world war, Lodge lost a son. Lost, as the phraseology of the world has it; lost, of course, to ordinary vision. But Lodge was in possession of the best that psychical research could afford. He was not of those who accept the veil of death as impenetrable and let it go at that. He sought now to solace his heart through means of that information wherewith he had formerly sought to satisfy his intellect. Familiar with the methods of spiritualistic mediums, he came into such communication with his departed son as seemed conclusive to his mind, and to the minds of many who read the record of these efforts.

The book is remembered oftenest by the mere Christian name of this boy who made the supreme sacrifice for his country—"Raymond." The full title is

"Raymond, or life and death, with examples of the survival of memory and affection after death." It is lengthy. The first half is made up of a charming account of the family life of the Lodges, given in order to substantiate the truth of allusion and reminiscence brought, through mediumistic intervention, by the spirit of the disembodied son. The latter portion is occupied with records of communication received at seances.

In publishing this volume it is probable that the author held no purpose other than to lay before students of psychical research the substance of his latest discoveries, or to reinforce the new-found consolation of others whom sorrow had brought into contact with spirit communication. But there were thousands upon thousands of homes bereft by the war. The topic of the book was timely—it struck a universal note. Public libraries purchased it, even when it happened to be the sole book of the sort in their catalogues. That it should be the first book on such a subject coming into the hands of a reader, is perhaps regrettable. For, understandable enough to the seasoned researcher or spiritualist, there are statements in "Raymond" likely to be met by the uninitiated with a derisive half-pity. In justice to the subject and to Sir Oliver Lodge (who probably never dreamed this work would become a "best seller"!) it should be borne in mind that "Raymond" is not preliminary reading. In order to appreciate the value of these intimate seance records of Sir Oliver and Lady Lodge, it is better to precede the reading of this book with one of the general surveys of psychic phenomena, giving certain preparatory ideas of the nature and limitations of spirit communication and seance-room procedure.

Conan Doyle was honored with knighthood and his name became world known on account of his ability as

a writer of fiction that endures as wholesome divertive reading. Therefore in approaching a later task of presenting for publication his ideas concerning proofs of life beyond death, he possessed a two-fold advantage. Long before that time his place had been won in the hearts of countless readers, and his pen was tipped with the magic gold of the born writer.

Sir Arthur Conan Doyle did not rush hastily into print upon psychic matters because such topics happened to be in vogue. His study of the evidence for continuity of life had begun in the days when he was a practicing physician, prior to the brilliant period of his literary fame. Research and experience covering a long term of years qualified Doyle to speak with authority concerning matters of spirit manifestation. Keeping silent until he felt within himself no vestige of doubt as to his viewpoint, Doyle finally set aside all other interests to devote his life to writing and lecturing with the idea of spreading the knowledge that human beings considered as "dead" can and do communicate with the dwellers of earth.

As a result of his extended lecture tours through America and other countries, Doyle has published some books of travel, spiced with spiritistic adventure and comment. Thus, in giving a running account of his trips, he has sugar-coated slight doses of spiritualism. But antedating these travel books he had produced (in 1918 and 1919) two others devoted unqualifiedly to the subject of spiritualism—"The new revelation," and "The vital message."

"The vital message" is brief, piquant and readable, enlivened somewhat with incident, and of course able to hold attention on account of the bright manner in which it is offered. As its title indicates, it urges the importance of the knowledge of spirit communication, and continues

the effort of "The new revelation" to argue the religious application of spirit phenomena.

More recently the same author has issued "The case for spirit photography," a small volume whose title indicates a defense of the use of the camera in furnishing proof of spirit intelligence. "The coming of the fairies," still another recent production, gives a unique account occasioning considerable comment. This describes the ability of two small girls to perceive tiny sprites—a matter difficult for any but occultists to admit as serious. These assertions, nevertheless, are backed up by photographs secured of some of the "fairies."

But thus far, of Doyle's several books dealing with after-death existence, his first volume of this nature "The new revelation"—marks his highest achievement. The aim of "The new revelation" is to point out the relationship of psychic phenomena and religion. While a few other authors have held like ideas, no similar book handles this aspect of spiritism with just the outlook of Doyle. The book is brief, and is an excellent early volume for those to whom acquaintance with its subject is a fresh venture. It proceeds in the generalizing manner of an essay or discourse, recounting occasional experiences without going into technical explanation. Readably, with no domineering inflection, yet with force and power, is the case stated—that the facts of spirit communication support rather than undermine religion. Moreover, quite apart from consideration of the subject exploited, the skill of Sir Arthur Conan Doyle has here wrought chapters of literary distinction, so welded together that the coherence of the whole adds greatly to its effectiveness.

CHAPTER V

WITH THE SPIRITUALISTS

In attempting to point out certain books of a definitely spiritualistic nature, it is only fair to emphasize that Judge Edmonds and other writers in the vanguard of the movement were as genuinely spiritualistic as was possible for their time. Yet in their day spiritualism had not crystallized into a distinct religious cult, or adopted the definite tenets of a platform. The present chapter aims to mention works appearing under the actual banner of spiritualism, in the years since spiritualists have held together in persistent groups. (In other chapters herein are many books inclining toward spiritualism rather than toward the position of psychical research or of mere spiritism, but on account of some special feature such volumes have seemed to classify more properly under the particular headings to which they have been assigned.)

An actual "spiritualist" is one who holds as the central thought of his religious life the assurance of future existence as based upon spirit manifestation, and who endeavors to shape his conduct according to spirit teachings. In distinction, many if not all "psychical researchers" decry all notion of a religious angle to their studies. Still another class of observers, who are not connected with the movement of psychical research, admit the truth of spirit communication apart from a religious significance, and are here termed "spiritists." To indicate still more plainly the application of the word "spiritualist" and the shades of opinion grading up to dyed-in-the-wool spiritualism, it may be pointed out that

neither Barrett, Hyslop nor Lodge (writers previously mentioned herein) has ever been affiliated with spiritualistic societies, or leaned strongly to the religious bearing of psychical knowledge. Doyle—more friendly to the spiritualists—is especially influenced by the religious aspect of spirit manifestation, arguing that spiritualistic ideas should be absorbed and become a part of the teachings of all churches; an attitude not exactly coincident with the hopes of those cleaving to spiritualism as a religion in itself. And at the present time no minister serving in any except a spiritualistic church can rightfully be called a spiritualist, although he may share most of the spiritualistic beliefs.

Thus, only a limited number of authors writing upon spirit phenomena can be classed as actual spiritualists. Definitely allied with spiritualism, at an early time but later than those named as "pioneers," appeared the poet, Gerald Massey. While many writers of verse and song have tintured their works with ideas satisfying all demands of ardent spiritualism, Massey stands alone among poets in having stepped aside from poetic forms to bring out a prose work defending spiritualistic beliefs. His book, "Concerning spiritualism," appeared in 1872. It is currently unobtainable to-day, surviving only on certain library shelves. But both before and after its publication Gerald Massey lectured often upon the subject of spirit manifestation, and the power of the single book mentioned is reinforced by the knowledge of how openly and with what perseverance this man championed the cause of spiritualism.

Another book no longer in print but still often obtainable at second-hand, and available on library shelves, bears the title "Nineteenth century miracles; or, Spirits and their work in every country of the earth." This was

produced in 1883 by Emma Hardinge Britten, thoroughly a spiritualist, who lectured and wrote upon spirit phenomena. A mine of informative reading of a brisk, lively character, this work stands as the most important volume constructed by this author.

Coming to the consideration of later writers, who range their efforts with actual spiritualism, a high place in the record must be accorded to J. Arthur Hill, of England. His chief work bears the straightforward caption, "Spiritualism, its history, phenomena and doctrine." In it, as the expanded title indicates, he has brought together an historical resume of his subject, setting forth noteworthy phenomena and deductions therefrom.

Despite its comprehensiveness the book is clear and affords pleasing reading. It will be found sufficiently informative to encompass the subject, in any case where a reader does not seek more than a good general idea of the ground covered by spiritualism. Likewise it provides an excellent foundation from which to proceed toward the consideration of particular departments of spiritualistic discovery, or special phases of mediumship.

The foregoing is not the only volume which Hill has constructed. His book "Psychical investigations" comprises verbatim reports of seance occurrences—the nature of such material necessitating an account considerably drawn out. Another work—"Man is a spirit"—is less lengthy and more fluent than the "Psychical investigations." But the book "Spiritualism" (published in 1919) represents by far the best effort put forth by this author, and it indeed ranks among the foremost works of its class.

The position taken by Hill, of course, is among those who would delve into psychic matters not only with scientific approach, but with the aim to lay the results

close to the deepest springs of human action. To the furtherance of this cause J. Arthur Hill has devoted his life.

Another general work on spiritualism, which although written more than a quarter of a century ago will not be harmed by comparison with the most up-to-date accounts of spirit phenomena and philosophy, is "The scientific basis of spiritualism," by Epes Sargent. This is an American publication, still obtainable from spiritualistic organizations and publishers of spiritualistic literature.

Mr. Sargent was a gifted author and editor. His name will be familiar to many as having appeared on the covers of school reading books, for Sargent's scholarship and inclinations qualified him to compile a series of school readers widely used in the United States. Later, in seeking to put through the press the psychic information of whose truth experience had assured him, this author was enabled, by his bookish nature and thorough literary training, to bring his material into fine arrangement and construction. Sargent's volume may be found in many libraries, and when the shelves stand bare of more recent and hence better known books, this one will furnish satisfaction indeed to those liking its subject.

Somewhat briefer than the general treatises by Sargent and Hill, is the work of Horace Leaf, entitled "What is this spiritualism?" Mr. Leaf is an active worker in the interests of spiritualism in England. As honorable secretary of the Spiritualist Education Council he has kept in close touch with each step of present investigations and every conclusion arrived at. His volume (published in 1919) while not drawn out to great length, arrays a complete and vigorous line of defense to stand for the claims of spiritualism.

Various methods have been employed, both by earnest scientists and enthusiastic spiritualists, in attempts to support the spiritistic hypothesis with proof which should be final and incontrovertible. Perhaps no more clinching evidence yet has been secured than that obtained by means of the camera. An account of what has been accomplished in this way is given in a book by James Coates, called "Photographing the invisible; practical studies in spirit photography, spirit portraiture and other rare but allied phenomena."

These are well written and convincing chapters, whose statements are reinforced by excellent plates. The popularity of the book (first published in 1911) has apparently outrun the publishers' estimates, since more than one bookseller has claimed it difficult to pick up; but indeed this is material worthy of publication in an edition sufficient to satisfy a craving which will not be disappointed upon actual reading. No one for whom spiritualism or psychic phenomena hold the slightest interest can fail to count as delightful the moments spent with this volume.

Mr. Coates is the author of another book, less widely known than the photography account, entitled "Seeing the invisible." This deals with clairvoyance and is intended for those initiated in spiritualistic knowledge, rather than for the general student.

When in 1917 J. Hewat McKenzie constructed his only volume upon this or any subject, he proved that in addition to the information and experience essential to an equipment for the task, he possessed exceptional talent for arrangement of content and clearness of expression. His book, "Spirit intercourse, its theory and practice," has for its object an explanation of what is known to-day regarding the various kinds of spirit manifestation. Under the handling of some writers, this subject-matter

would have turned out to be no more than a juiceless text. Mr. McKenzie, though, made it more than readable. To persons already attracted by spirit phenomena, an explanation of one mode or phase of mediumship after another—as given in the manner of this author—is of vivid interest. The book is well worthy of being a first choice in seeking what is meant by spirit manifestation or spirit mediumship.

Experience has taught that psychic power is a natural human faculty, and that just as a talent for music or drawing may be cultivated by exercise, so also the ability to "tune in" to the vibrations of a higher mode of existence may be developed in many persons. That attempts to use a mediumistic faculty are attended with risk, is as well recognized by fervent spiritualists as by those who attack the spiritistic propaganda. In order to set forth proper ways to attempt to receive spirit communication, and to state wise methods of determining whether or not an individual possesses marked psychic ability, a book entitled "A guide to mediumship and psychic unfoldment" was prepared by E. W. Wallis and M. H. Wallis.

Mr. Wallis was for many years editor of *Light*, a British spiritualistic journal of high standing. His book has nothing in common with the average pamphlet of instruction upon the cultivation of seership. Sound judgment and a conservative attitude characterize these clear paragraphs intended for those who are bound to test their ability as amateur mediums.

The work of Wallis is much fuller than the excellent pamphlet by Hudson Tuttle, a well-known American spiritualist. Tuttle's brief outline, however, will be found authoritative and enlightening for active investigators. It may be obtained from spiritualistic publishing offices, and is entitled "Mediumship."

The record of definitely spiritualistic works concerned with spirit phenomena is by no means as lengthy as is the list of writings approaching spirit manifestation without lifting the flag of spiritualism. Especially in past years, works avowedly spiritualistic have failed to attain as wide a hearing as have publications whose titles indicate the caution of psychical research or critical procedure. Many spiritualistic books have been in demand solely within the ranks of the spiritualists, and have survived only small editions before dropping from sight. Among such, several biographical accounts of celebrated mediums, revered in the annals of spiritualism, have made slight impress among non-spiritualists. A few of these biographies and records of the experience of professional mediums, as well as occasional volumes of teachings gleaned from spirit helpers, are obtainable to-day from publishers specializing in spiritualistic literature, or from the offices of spiritualistic journals. Also from such sources may be obtained general works dealing with the philosophy of spiritualism, its history, and the explanation of spirit teachings—books such as those of W. J. Colville (a noted inspirational speaker of a former generation); works of Mrs. Mary T. Longley (whose inspired words have not only been spoken from the rostrum, but have continually appeared in the columns of spiritualistic periodicals) ; books put forth by Mrs. M. E. Cadwallader, editor of *The Progressive Thinker*, a spiritualistic weekly; and the volumes proceeding from officials of spiritualistic organizations.

An example of a work whose only connection with proof of a discarnate source rests on the inability of its author to originate such writings, is "Psychosophy; soul teachings," given by the spirit helpers of Cora L. V. Richmond. Mrs. Richmond was known to English as

well as American spiritualists as an inspirational lecturer. Several books have been published, resulting from her powers to transmit thoughts from beyond. The book, "Psychosophy," is an extension of a former work, "The soul in human embodiment," and its teachings lead to ideas of reincarnation.

Thus the dividing line is sometimes difficult to draw between spiritualistic works having to do with proof of survival and those without the quality admitting them within a list evincing "evidential" characteristics. While non-spiritualists may contend that writings of slight concern with positive proof have been named, it is also inevitable that some books which are favorites among spiritualists shall, for one reason or another, have been omitted.

CHAPTER VI

OPPONENT AND DIVERGENT OPINIONS

Readers keeping the right to call themselves fair-minded will like to examine every side of a question so important as to bear upon man's future existence. By going over the ground taken by skeptics or antagonists, the over-credulous in spiritism will be assisted in preserving balance (just as opposition to after-death communication may be tempered by perusal of books making clear the position of conservative spiritualism). Further, it is of interest to look into the theories deduced by those who admit supernormal phenomena but offer explanation according to hypotheses constructed otherwise than upon a spiritistic basis.

From time to time arguments intended to counteract the spiritistic tidal wave have been published in book form, not only at the behest of the churches, but often apparently growing out of individual convictions apart from any relation to creed or religion. It is remarkable that such arguments should sometimes be founded upon little or no investigation, with the idea that the long-continued patient study of scholarly advocates of spiritism may be swept away by the words of those not qualified to judge.

For example, when Edward Clodd undertook to write a book entitled "If a man die shall he live again?"—this author was without the experience which should have been his before he presumed to deal with the subject of spirit phenomena. A number of free-thinking works concerned with evolution had made up Clodd's previous

contribution to the bookshelves of the world. For their clear-headed application to a particular line of thought, these had won a reputation which was not likely to be benefited by an excursion into territory where this writer lacked the essential traveling equipment. A newcomer should not feel warranted in attempting to discredit that which other workers have been digging for through a stretch of years—none realizing more keenly than the seekers themselves that their precious metal is found mixed with dross.

Written with some degree of experience but without the least melting of prejudice against spiritism, is a recent book by Houdini, publicly known as a performer in stage magic. In "A magician among the spiritualists" Houdini writes entertainingly of certain seance observations, but directs his scorn against even those of his friends who may happen to give credence to spirit manifestation.

Latterly, Houdini has appeared upon the lecture platform in opposition to spiritistic beliefs, and he was a dissenting member of a committee acting in an investigation of psychic phenomena conducted by the *Scientific American*. Although Sir Arthur Conan Doyle has held hope of winning Houdini to belief in spiritism, such a concession seems improbable from present indications. But in fairness to spiritualism, it must be said that this magician does not find it possible to duplicate or to explain what he denounces as mediumistic "trickery."

Works concerning spirit phenomena issued from the point of view of the Protestant church have seldom if ever been based on direct investigation, and where any experience whatsoever forms a background for such writings, it can not rank with the prolonged study of the psychical research societies.

Perhaps the best Protestant manual opposing spiritualistic ideas is by Jane T. Stoddart, entitled "The case against spiritualism" (1920). The book shows considerable perusal of spiritualistic literature, and has assembled all possible antagonistic material, gleaned even from works of believers all items which, when turned and moulded, are advantageous to the opposition. The weakness of this volume, however, lies in the lack of any actual first-hand observation and investigation comparable to the researches undertaken by those who uphold spiritualism.

Rev. Thomas J. Hardy, in "Spiritism in the light of the faith" (1919) has laid down the pronouncement of those of the established Church of England who look askance at such of their associates as reckon the spirit phenomena of the present time as having solemn concern with religion.

Certain adherents of the Catholic church have gone much further than has Protestantism in putting psychic phenomena to test. While some of the writings opposing spiritism and proceeding from persons evidently of the Catholic faith are no more than harangue, in contrast to these there are notable volumes showing thorough research.

John G. F. Raupert, a Catholic, proceeded far enough with the examination and consideration of spirit phenomena to qualify him to express views based upon a much firmer foundation than hearsay evidence. One of his books, a finely written account entitled "Modern spiritism" (1909) records actual psychical investigations, going over the ground in an unprejudiced manner. As is pointed out in the expanded title of this volume, there is here presented a "critical examination of the phenomena, character and teachings of spiritism in the light of

the known facts." The concluding arguments of this author contend that spirit communications are likely to be of devilish origin and should not be sought. But he here makes no attempt, as some opponents have done, merely to class all psychical phenomena as fraudulent and the defenders of spiritistic ideas as knaves or fools.

In some of his later books Raupert's opposition is less temperate, and in these he lays stress upon the dangers of psychic investigation—a phase of the subject which has by no means been overlooked by writers favoring spiritualism.

Another volume written from the Catholic standpoint, and in this instance based chiefly upon spiritualistic and psychical literature and not upon personal observation, is called "Spiritism and religion; can you talk to the dead? including a study of the most remarkable cases of spirit control." This was presented first in 1918 as a thesis at the Catholic University of America, in partial fulfillment of the requirements to obtain a degree. The author, Baron John Liljencrants, made so favorable an impression among Catholics with this scathing denunciation of spiritistic tendencies, that his thesis was brought out for general circulation.

Tremendously interesting is a certain work regarding the future state of life considered from the point of view of theosophy. C. W. Leadbeater, often a collaborer in theosophical teachings with that great leader, Mrs. Annie Besant, in his book called "The other side of death" has clearly presented the theosophical position concerning after-death conditions. Since such ideas are divergent from the conclusions of spiritualism or psychical research, but still have relation to spirit manifestation, the book is here included.

Thomson Jay Hudson put together a thought-provoking book entitled "The law of psychic phenomena; a working hypothesis for the systematic study of hypnotism, spiritism, mental therapeutics, etc." Without doubt this author arrived at much which bears upon the part played by the action of the mind in some attempts at securing spirit communication. The attitude of his book, which has been published in repeated editions, is in line with the arguments of students of psychology who find in the operation of the brain an explanation which satisfies them as to the source of what others regard as spirit manifestation.

"The quest for Dean Bridgman Connor," by A. J. Philpott, gives an account of attempts to locate a missing man through the aid of mediumistic powers. The famous medium, Mrs. Leonora E. Piper, had part in this endeavor, and Richard Hodgson, noted for his activities in the interest of psychical research, supervised some of the efforts. As the search was ineffectual, this book supplies ammunition for the opponents of spiritualism.

But also, in common with other volumes intended to counteract spiritualistic tendencies, the Philpott book may be recommended as furnishing food for reflection and assistance toward necessary stability in the case of confirmed spiritualists too ready to believe. For there are whole armies of people, who, when convinced of the truth of spirit communication, expect thereafter to receive through the powers of a medium anything and everything desirable to learn or to have accomplished, without conformity to the laws of human progress and the natural limitations of spirit phenomena.

CHAPTER VII

THE INTERESTED CLERGY

In the eighteenth century John Wesley, founder of Methodism, strove to discourage psychic happenings in his vicinity, believing that such were produced only by spirits of evil intent. The opportunity thus rejected by this powerful and influential personality might have aided in the enlightenment of mankind, for in Wesley's diary he has recorded the repeated occurrence of wonderful unsought phenomena in his household. Frequently alluded to in general works upon spiritualism, these happenings form the special topic of a London book of 1917, edited by Dudley Wright—"The Epworth phenomena; with some of the psychic experiences recorded by Wesley in his journal."

Going along into the nineteenth century, one of the most remarkable mediums who ever lived — Stainton Moses — had in early life been a curate of the Church of England. It is stated that on account of poor health he relinquished the ministry to become master in a London school, and it was chiefly during this later period (or after the year 1872) that he made known his psychical experiences.

With affectionate memories of Oxford University, from which he had been graduated, Stainton Moses chose to inscribe "M. A., Oxon.," as a pen name whenever he issued a work for publication. Although his several books on spirit phenomena are now no longer in print and are rarely to be found even in great libraries, yet a mass of printed matter is available concerning him.

Having associated himself with the British Society for Psychological Research, the mediumship of Stainton Moses became a matter of observation in that organization, and extensive records are taken up with experiments testing this man's psychic faculties. Further, since various authors dealing in a general way with the history of psychic phenomena have had occasion to refer to work done by the psychological research societies, accounts of the mediumship of Stainton Moses appear in many of these general treatises. Everywhere the integrity of this man was deemed irreproachable, while his scholarship stood forth in marked distinction to the usual educational qualifications of those developing mediumship. The possibility of practices of self-deception was removed on account of his mental caliber, and in the memory of Stainton Moses spiritualism can point to one medium, at least, whom no one ever had the conscience to call fraudulent.

By the twentieth century it has become not uncommon in England for a clergyman to continue in his ministerial connection with an orthodox Protestant church while openly avowing conviction of the truth of spirit communication. Today the English authors of several widely-read books dealing with the reality of spirit manifestation are occupying Protestant pulpits, with both parishioners and superiors in acquiescence.

Some of the books coming from clergymen-authors in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries approach psychical subjects indeed in a manner to strengthen religious feeling rather than undermine it. The writings of Rev. Arthur Chambers, vicar of an English parish, have for their purpose enlargement of the Christian understanding of the life to come. The method of this writer is to build a structure of what he regards as truth upon

foundations acceptable to churchly teachings, finding a cornerstone in the Bible itself.

His book entitled "Our life after death; or, The teaching of the Bible concerning the unseen world," has passed through many more than a hundred editions, with undiminished appeal since its first appearance a quarter of a century ago. Other similar works by the same author are also finely constructed, but the foregoing stands as perhaps his strongest effort. Such presentation of the idea of spirit survival is so amalgamated with former religious concepts as to lead toward recognition of the proofs of continuity of life. Many who themselves might be content to stand upon a basis of faith alone, are won to a realization that scientific demonstration reinforces, for many outside of the churches, what Biblical precept has taught. No public library collection of over five thousand volumes should fail to give representation to the books of Chambers, which will uplift all who come into their lofty atmosphere.

The consideration of books tracing throughout the Bible the many recorded instances of phenomena arising from spirit sources, brings to mind the "Encyclopedia of Biblical spiritualism," compiled by Moses Hull. This is a brief list of references noting by chapter and verse the numerous Bible allusions to spirit manifestation. Published more than twenty-five years ago, this book is at present obtainable only through spiritualistic publishing concerns or agencies. Moses Hull had been a minister serving an evangelical church in America. In his day he had the choice between bottling up his convictions concerning spiritualism or leaving his pulpit. He chose to enter the lists for spiritualism, becoming a celebrated lecturer on the spiritualistic rostrum. His brief "encyclopedia" made no attempt to shape its information

into beautiful and readable chapters such as were constructed by Arthur Chambers upon a similar basis, yet many spiritualists have been glad to look to the Hull manual for guidance to connect their thoughts with scriptural passages, and among several books by this author, the Biblical collection is the volume most widely in use.

From another minister who became identified with the spiritualistic movement in America, Rev. E. W. Sprague, has come the book "All the spiritualism of the Bible, and the Scripture directly opposing it." This title is explanatory of the nature of the volume, which is one of several from the same author, well-known among spiritualists.

America has not ranked with England in the number of clergymen-authors who have defended spiritistic claims. But in the Unitarian ministry, from whose platform larger liberality of view might be expected than from adherents to more exacting creeds, there have been a few American writers concerning themselves with psychic phenomena. Of these the most prominent was Minot J. Savage, who in the first years of the twentieth century contributed more than one volume upon such matters. His most noteworthy book of this sort is entitled "Can telepathy explain?—Results of psychical research." As this wording indicates, instances are here assembled which seem to preclude any reasonable explanation except the intervention of a discarnate intelligence. Rev. Minot J. Savage was a brilliant writer as well as preacher. His paragraphs are pungent—never flavorless—and this citation is replete with incidents supporting the idea that well-directed mind-action persists after physical dissolution.

While it is the intent of the present book list to give place to writings dealing with actual proof of future survival rather than to call attention to descriptions of spirit life and conditions, yet exception is now made in mentioning the descriptive works of G. Vale Owen, who can not be overlooked in scanning the names of clergymen who publicly acknowledge spiritistic beliefs.

Rev. G. Vale Owen, vicar of the parish church of Orford, England, has received lengthy communications, chiefly through the planchette method. Believing that these writings came to him from the spirit world, he has published them (1920-21) in a work called "The life beyond the veil." The titles assigned to the individual volumes of this four-volume compilation give an idea of their substance: Volume 1, "The lowlands of heaven;" volume 2, "The highlands of heaven;" volume 3, "The ministry of heaven;" volume 4, "The battalions of heaven."

This clergyman formed the habit of sitting alone in the vestry of his church to receive these statements. He is evidently sincere in his understanding that the content of his volumes has reached his mentality from "beyond the veil," and his books, in addition to their general appeal, have special attraction for persons who themselves have undertaken to obtain communications in similar manner.

Rev. F. Fielding-Ould, of another English pulpit, has put forth a number of pamphlets, giving out freely his ideas upon spirit communication and showing his inclination to belief therein. Characteristic of his manner of dealing with these topics is this author's book "The wonders of the saints in the light of spiritualism."

Rev. Walter Wynn, of the Baptist ministry in England, having been led to a realization of the proofs of spirit

continuity, determined (in 1919) to share with the world the results of his experience. When "death," so-called, deprived Mr. Wynn of the physical presence of a son, persistent seeking for a message from this boy culminated in victory. This the pastor exultantly proclaimed in a book entitled "Rupert lives!"

Mr. Wynn writes with racing pen and heart astir. Surely the information he has given can introduce no discordant note into the usual comfort which a minister of the gospel has had to offer to bereavement. Rather does such a record supplement the solace formerly held out, bringing into nearness those who have gone beyond ordinary vision.

A "book test" is a method of offering proof that ideas conveyed through a supposed spirit source do not proceed merely from the subconscious mind of the mortal in the case. For example, a quotation, long or brief, may be cited by a spirit, with reference to a particular chapter, page and line where the same may be found. This "book test" procedure seems originally to have been suggested by the denizens of the spirit world. Stainton Moses—already named as a clergyman of wonderful mediumistic power—was the recipient of certain book tests often described in psychical literature. Recently (1924) Rev. Charles Drayton Thomas, an English Wesleyan minister, has had published his experience in receiving book tests and newspaper tests. "Some new evidence for human survival" is the title he has assigned to this valuable declaration regarding his psychical studies, wherein spirit communication has been backed up by what would seem to be somewhat evidential support.

When in 1921 there came from press "Man's survival after death," it was clear that the author, Rev. Charles

Tweedale, had added to the literature of his subject a momentous volume.

The home life of Mr. Tweedale, vicar of an English parish, had been marvelously filled with manifestations such as can only be produced by the strongest type of psychic power. Several members of this clergyman's family were endowed with superior mediumistic gifts, and all of the household, including Tweedale himself, possessed in some degree the sensitiveness which can perceive beyond the range of common sight and hearing. Therefore, while others could narrate their seance experiences with various mediums, or recount the progress of psychical science as based upon the investigations of numerous students and researchers, Mr. Tweedale could go further. He was able to add to material such as this his avowals that marvels had taken place within the walls of his own dwelling, unaided by the power of any outsider.

Thus few individuals have been possessed of such an array of qualifications as enter into the endowment of this man for the task of writing upon spirit communication and manifestation: general scholarship; wide reading upon the special subject of psychic phenomena; fluency in presenting in literary form the rich experience of private, personal psychic adventures approaching the miraculous—and the reputation of an active clergyman to back up the statements.

CHAPTER VIII

AUTOMATIC WRITINGS, SPIRIT LETTERS, PLANCHETTE AND OUIJA BOARD MESSAGES

Messages written or spelt out are attributed to spirit origin when received in a number of ways. In the planchette method, the fingers of the mortal operators rest upon a small wheeled board, which carries a pencil to trace words or sentences presumably coming from the spirit world. Differing from a planchette is the well-known ouija board, marked with an alphabet, wherefrom messages may be formed somewhat slowly, letter by letter being pointed out. The indication of words or letters by spirit responses made through table-tilting or by means of "raps" (now understood to be electrical sounds) is still another mode of transmitting verbal messages. "Automatic" writing—called also involuntary writing — is a common form of communication. In its telepathic form, a thought apparently strikes the brain just prior to or simultaneously with the motion of the hand in putting down the words. A rarer sort of mediumship is that in which a spirit evidently obtains direct muscular control of the hand of the writer. Independent writing is also obtained—the hand of the medium having no contact with the pencil as it writes, sometimes within sight or hearing of several persons. Detailed description of these several phases of writing mediumship can be found in the larger general works on spiritualism and modes of spirit communication.

Much of the substance set forth in so-called automatic writing carries no particular proof pointing toward a spirit source, or bringing forth matter of evidential character.

The circumstances under which the communication has been received, and the reputation of the compiler for veracity, constitute the value of books based upon such messages.

The late W. T. Stead, founder and long editor of the British magazine *Review of Reviews*, and widely known as a brilliant journalist, was one of those who experimented privately with the idea of obtaining spirit communications through messages written by his own hand. Thus he began to receive writings which continued during a considerable time, seeming to come from a departed lady with whom he had had some acquaintance. This discarnate writer was by name Miss Julia Ames, former editor of the *Union Signal*, an American temperance publication. It has been said that the family of Miss Ames resented the idea of these communications, and it is conceivable that such an innovation as writing on the part of a person "beyond the grave" may seem horrifying to those of orthodox habit of mind whose imagination pictures the future differently. But at any rate these writings are of an intellectual and moral order to bring chagrin to no one. They form vivacious reading—telling of conditions to be expected in the world to come—laying stress upon the duties of earth life, and so on. The notes of Mr. Stead run brightly throughout in explanatory comment.

The book has been brought out in several editions, the first (1897) entitled "Letters from Julia." The title "After death," adopted in a later edition, is also carried by the latest compilation, containing some additional letters. This final edition was prepared by the daughter of Stead, after her illustrious father's earthly career had come to a tragic close. (It will be recalled that W. T. Stead was an ill-fated passenger on the steamer *Titanic*.)

Mr. Stead's work in psychic fields was carried on in his own independent way for a long time. Through a period of several years he published a magazine called *Borderland*, devoted to the recital of psychic happenings. Also, an especially effective small book, "How I know that the dead return," gave in concise form this author's understanding of the reality of future existence—a clear, powerful statement of certain bits of evidence having weight in shaping his confidence in spirit survival. This little book is not now easily obtainable, although a reprinting might perhaps be hoped for, since the demand for it quickly absorbed all copies put on sale. But "After death," the book of Julia's letters, remains the most important volume left by W. T. Stead to the province of psychical study.

Miss Elsa Barker, an American writer of fiction, discovered that her pencil seemed to exhibit independent activity, and that she was receiving automatic or spirit writing. The series of letters which she thenceforth set down are said to have come from the spirit of judge David P. Hatch, of Los Angeles. Miss Barker called the first volume of these communications (1914) "Letters from a living dead man." A later and similar volume is entitled "War letters of the living dead man," while a final contribution bears the caption "Last letters of the living dead man." The letters are filled with impressions of spirit life and give considerable counsel and moral instruction. The "Last letters" refer frequently to America and her future. All of these books have popularity, being put together in a way which has found favor with a great many readers.

A most likable record of experiences in receiving spirit writing is given in a work by Margaret Cameron (Mrs. H. C. Lewis) called "The seven purposes" (1918).
The

author is well known as an American writer of fiction and her literary facility of course adds much toward the making of a delightful presentation.

Without study of psychic phenomena and with little or no inclination to believe in spirit manifestation, this author attempted with a ouija board to obtain some communication, for solace of a bereaved friend. Soon she discovered that she possessed extraordinary psychic power, advancing to the method of obtaining automatically written messages.

Her book describes her success in all this, as well as the receipt of certain unaccountable communications of a less satisfactory nature, and in addition there are given several sermonizing chapters, comprising teachings from spirit sources. This didactic portion, from which the book takes its name, is not a mere succession of platitudes, but has freshness and vigor of idea as well as manner, and the publishers have reprinted this section in separate form.

A number of books have been put on the market with the claim that their content has been received from one noted author or another, now in spirit life, the method having been adopted of spelling out these posthumous writings on a ouija board. Most of such productions would add nothing to the reputation of these departed people, and the indication is that either the celebrated authors themselves are not the spirit operators, or the process of transmitting their ideas has destroyed the effectiveness of the writings, however honest may have been the efforts of the mortal recipients.

Up to the present time the most notable book received by the ouija board is "Patience Worth." Mr. Casper S. Yost, editorial director of the *St. Louis Globe Democrat*, compiled the book in 1916, and he and Mr. William

Marion Reedy, of *Reedy's Mirror*, vouch for the authenticity of the manner of obtaining these writings, which were taken down by two well-known St. Louis women.

The remarkable feature of the communications lies in their high literary character, the communicating spirit having an inclination for literary composition rather than for explaining conditions of the spirit world or for expounding moral truisms. No sustained effort at receiving spirit communications has ever before brought forth productions comparable in literary quality to these bits of poetry, drama, and epigrammatic sentences. In addition to this distinctiveness, an evidential element of exceptional value attaches to the messages. English of an era long past—language unheard of by the persons who took down the words letter by letter—is woven throughout Patience Worth's contributions. And as an illustration of the extent to which ouija board messages can be carried, it is to be noted that subsequently to the receipt of the writings collected in the foregoing volume the spirit of Patience Worth has dictated through the same amanuenses two novels, "A sorry tale," and "Hope Trueblood."

Frederick Bligh Bond, an English architect of note, received from the Archaeological Society of Somersetshire a commission to make excavations and restore portions of a famous Benedictine abbey at Glastonbury, one of the earliest ecclesiastical institutions in England. After ineffectual attempts at locating the ruins, Mr. Bond sought aid through the unprofessional mediumship of an acquaintance. By means of automatic writing, accompanied by sketches, directions were received which led with unerring accuracy to the location and reconstruction of a chapel. The description of these Various steps of progress toward an amazingly successful termination has'

been given by Mr. Bond in a book (1922) called "The gate of remembrance."

This book should not be chosen by a reader desiring entertainment or the rush of fluent chapters. Much of the matter is in the stiffened manner of early English, and even when transcribed by the architect author it is difficult to comprehend. However, being of great value as evidence of spirit survival, "The gate of remembrance" has important place in the consideration of a scholar specializing in psychical research. Later, through the same medium, were received predictions relative to the world war, with reference to prospective social changes. These messages, compiled with foreword and remarks by another architect, form a volume entitled "The hill of vision."

A recent convert to the ranks of those accepting spirit communication as a fact is Basil King, known as the author of "The inner shrine," and other widely read novels. Certain of this writer's fiction productions have carried psychical ideas as a partial motive' but in "The abolishing of death," published in 1919, a complete departure was made from imaginative writing. Here are compiled messages of a general character, giving description and counsel, as received by automatic method through the mediumship of a woman friend. The pleasing literary style of the author need not be expected in this book, the content having been given as recorded by the recipient and not reset in Mr. King's phraseology. In substance these messages are similar to many existing writings from spirit sources, their interest resting in the fact that a well-known novelist earnestly believed them of spirit origin.

William C. Comstock, after forty years of active business life, developed a facility in receiving writing which

according to his understanding—was dictated by spirit intelligences. Such communications form the basis of several books, a representative title being "Thought for help, from those who know men's need." These works comprise advice and explanation regarding the conduct of life, the statements varying in coherence and clearness. Certain of the messages the author sincerely believes came from some of the great minds of the past. While not suited to the needs of the uninitiated, believers will extract from this material portions which will mean increased understanding. Mr. Comstock in 1923, by selecting bits from his various volumes, commenting on the interpretation of these paragraphs, and describing his experience in psychical study, made a book useful and attractive in itself, and illuminating when applied in connection with his previous compilations. The title of this is "A psychical experience; a man works for help with personalities in the wider life."

Nancy K. Dearmer (wife of Rev. Percy Dearmer, himself author of a number of books of travel and kindred subjects) felt impelled to write, and in 1919 regularly placed on paper thoughts which drove her hand along. Not read until completed, the manuscript then appeared to be the work of a man who had wished to write when in earth life, and who had fallen in France in 1918. Giving some description of spirit conditions, this consists chiefly of counsel and suggestion as to human betterment. The title is "The fellowship of the picture."

A book of 1920 called "Meslom's messages" (also published under the title "To woman from Meslom") comprises writings apparently received from a spirit named "Meslom," who claimed to have been long a dweller in the life beyond. The compiler of these writings, Mary A. McEvilly, as an investigator had made various

attempts with a planchette to receive spirit communications and had learned that a certain spirit (Meslom) took interest in her efforts. At the request of a woman in grief over death of a son, a trial was made to obtain some message for her benefit. As a result, a continued and vigorous succession of messages was received, These were put together in the volume named, their substance pertaining to spirit conditions and including moral suggestions. The son in question was evidently present and contributed to the communications.

A book entitled "Our unseen guest" partially counteracts its anonymous presentation on account of the author getting in touch with one of the spirit communicators of Margaret Cameron's band of scribes. (As mentioned previously in this chapter, "The seven purposes", by Margaret Cameron, is a well-liked statement of an automatic writing experience.) The psychic manifestations told about in "Our unseen guest" are chiefly ouija board messages, and the style of the book is brisk and magnetic.

Anne W. Lane, wife of Franklin K. Lane, and Harriet Blaine Beale, a daughter of James G. Blaine, Made known the results of their experience in receiving automatic writing, in a book published in 1920. These cultivated women felt that they had been in touch with lofty intelligences of the spirit world. Their own sincerity and strength of conviction, and something of the nature of the matter received, is evidenced in the title—"To walk with God." A later volume by the same writers is entitled "Life in the circles."

In a book called "Bugle" are recorded the messages which came unsought, by means of automatic script, from a young Boston medical student who suddenly passed out of earth life as the result of an automobile accident. Dr. Betsey B. Hicks, the recipient of the messages had

had a slight acquaintance with Kendall Lincoln Achorn, the spirit writer. The full title of the book is "Bugle; reveille in the life beyond, a bit of comfort to soldiers' mothers, wives and friends" (1918).

Some who receive automatic writing make the statement that a semi-involuntary writing can occur, the idea or the word seeming to reach the brain from an outside source an instant before the push of the pencil. This telepathic method prevailed in the messages comprising the book "Private Dowding" (1919) whose content relates in a general way to the life beyond, without attempting to carry conviction by going into personal details. The complete title of this book is "Private Dowding; a plain record of the after death experiences of a soldier killed in battle, and some questions in world issues answered by the messenger who taught him wider truths; with notes by W. T. P."

"The meeting of the spheres" is a volume of letters purporting to be from an individual who had been in spirit life for fifty years. Charlotte G. Herbine compiled this book, she with another medium having received these letter-messages. The precise manner in which they came (whether by spirit writing, telepathy, or otherwise) is not stated. The book was published in England in 1915, appearing in America in a more recent edition. A chapter of scientific predictions is included in this material, and while some of these prognostications seem curious, others show accord with certain of the theories now first being approached by the scientific world. That all this proceeded from an intelligence beyond earthly attachment is presumable from the quality of the letters, and not on account of special evidence offered therein. To any who look to the more advanced spiritualistic philosophy for strength and comfort, these

letters (sometimes spoken of as "Letters from Doctor Coulter") will prove a source of inspiration and expanded thought.

Six years of experience with automatic communication and ouija board messages give background for a book called "Voices from the void" (1919). Mrs. Hester Travers Smith, a daughter of Edward Dowden, was the recipient of these messages, and Sir William Fletcher Barrett contributed to the volume some prefatory remarks. Holt, in his great work "The cosmic relations and immortality," accords to this book a first place among the productions of automatic writing. The value of this record, in the opinion of both Barrett and Holt, rests not upon its informative nature but upon the critical attitude of Mrs. Smith, who discusses the evidential importance of the material. Sometimes facts received outside of the knowledge of this amanuensis were verifiable as truth, and again false statements were communicated. The conclusion reached by the compiler was that the operation of spirit intelligences was in some instances proven by the writings.

"I heard a voice; or, The great exploration" (1918) is a book published anonymously except for the information that it is presented "by a King's counsel." The compiler, a member of the legal profession in London, has brought together messages received through automatic and planchette writing by his two young daughters. Many of these communications are tinged with religion in accordance with the language and belief of Christian orthodoxy. Some of the writings were given in old English.

The four volumes of Rev. G. Vale Owen's work, "The life beyond the veil," were received by him through spirit writing, sometimes by means of a planchette. Since

these books have come from a curate of the Church of England, they are classed, with a further descriptive note, in the chapter dealing with the efforts of clergymen in behalf of psychical knowledge.

In "Gone west, by a soldier doctor" (1919) are recorded messages from a departed physician in communication to two women to whom he had been a friend and adviser. F. W. Kendall, literary editor of the Buffalo Sunday Express, vouches for the integrity of these unprofessional psychics, H. M. Grove and M. M. Hunt. The messages came first by automatic writing, later apparently through telepathic method. The physician, who in early life had been a soldier in the Civil War, claims to have served on the spirit side of life during the recent world conflict.

The books thus far mentioned in this section upon spirit letters and spirit writings, have resulted from some research motive other than personal bereavement. Yet private grief has often been the pressing cause responsible for attempts at spirit communication through the well-liked method of the written message. And when comfort for sorrow has been arrived at in this manner, the urge to lead others toward similar gratification has been the reason for publication of the records in the case. In listing a few of such books, no disparagement is intended of other works of like nature which have not been here included; but only a small number of representative, books have been chosen to indicate the character of the many volumes based on spirit writings which have been produced either during the tragic losses of the War period, or after separations occurring in ordinary human experience.

Discovering that she could receive automatic writing from a brother and sister in spirit, Mary Blount White

found such messages so comforting to her family that she decided to make public (1917) the results of her communication, in the hope of extending to others a similar solace. "Letters from Harry and Helen" are given in a small book which has been found to meet a certain demand for messages of this character.

From like motive, communications received by Leon Herbert Stevens from Leroy S. Stevens were published under the title "Letters from Roy; or, The spirit voice, being a series of messages received during daily communication with Leroy S. Stevens, who passed to spirit life on March 30, 1916." This book was received with sufficient interest to encourage the publication of a second volume of the same substance.

The method is an old one, of establishing communication with disembodied persons by means of raps received according to the alphabet or some code of words. Usually this manner of communication leads to other branches of psychical study. Julius Magnussen, a Danish dramatist, states that he first entered into communication with his father by the process of receiving raps translatable into sentences. A book (published in English in 1920) which the author has called "God's smile" recounts in fervent narration Magnussen's experiences in obtaining rappings and subsequent automatic writing. Certainty that the personal existence of individuals continues after physical death was the conclusion reached by this astounded seeker. The rather remarkable title of the book is explained by its closing words, to the effect that publication proceeded from a desire to reveal this wondrous tale to those blinded by tears, in order that they too may say, "God smiles to the world."

"Thy son liveth" is a brief book, but it is packed full of ideas and is alive with human concern. The manuscript

of this volume was submitted anonymously to the publishers, with the request that it be put out in inexpensive form, to give as many as possible the opportunity to look it over. Since its publication the name of the author has been made known—Mrs. L. N. Geldert (Grace D. Boylan). Her son, falling "somewhere in France" during the World War, succeeded in giving to his mother the first notice of his physical death. This was accomplished through a wireless instrument, in which he had been greatly interested. Having later suggested that pencil messages could be given, the material of which the book is made up—principally lively information concerning spirit life—was written down as received by the mother's brain. That the recital might extend consolation to other "gold star" mothers, seems to have been the desire of the author, and the book is widely demanded.

CHAPTER IX

CRITICAL OBSERVERS

Not a few writers dealing with psychical studies or with spirit phenomena approach their subject in the mood of critical observation, treading with more than ordinary caution and reserve. As yet unconvinced of the reality of communication from beyond the "great divide", these authors do not attempt an appeal to those seeking comfort in sorrow, but draw the attention of minds considering psychical, research as an educational factor. Works of this sort are usually the product of scholarly mentalities, and many of these books, of course, are likely to present rather complex substance.

In this class of writings, "Spirit and matter before the bar of modern science," presented in 1910 by I. W. Heysinger, offers a tremendous armory of quotations and assembled conclusions taken from all the leading investigators of psychic phenomena. Naturally, this material does not shape itself into a connective account or comprise simple reading. Yet it presents' an admirable review, comprehensively surveying the march of psychic science, while holding down the record to the limits of a single volume.

Constructed more in the manner of a narrative is Maxwell's "Metaphysical phenomena; methods and observations" (1905). In spite of its adherence to important considerations, this volume has a certain readableness. No attempt has here been made to lay down finalities or to lead toward positive assertions. The statements are given merely as the unbiased observations

of a witness. In his contact with psychical research, Joseph Maxwell had the means and leisure to study a favorite subject. His sense of gratification in a happily chosen pursuit shines through his paragraphs and will be found to penetrate the feelings of the reader.

The works of Frank Podmore never arrived at the conclusion that spirit survival is a proven fact. Indeed to many persons Mr. Podmore often seemed entirely too skeptical to be rated as an observer without bias or prejudice. As an indication of his bent of mind, it is stated that fellow-members of Podmore in the British Society for Psychical Research considered this man's attitude as an effective brake on the credulity of the rest. Of scholarly inclinations, Podmore for many years figured importantly in studies of various forms of psychic phenomena. Of a number of books in which he made plain his ideas, "The newer spiritualism" (1911) may be taken as representing this writer's standpoint and his manner of stating inferences regarding evidence of the life to come. This and any other of his productions form reading appreciated by the serious and cautious student of psychical science—the sort of material better suited to the study-hour than to intervals of recreation.

Hereward Carrington has been a most prolific writer upon psychical subjects, with countless magazine articles to his credit, as well as a number of books. In his investigations he has not been rapidly led toward conviction of the truth of spirit manifestation, and in putting into print his findings at various points along the way he has given a record of progressive study. Since he goes over the entire territory of psychic phenomena, it is to be expected that much of this ground is likewise traversed in the works of other authors. But in choosing from the writings of Carrington a volume important

and indicative of his thought, attention turns to his account of the Italian medium, Palladino.

While a number of writers have reviewed the mediumship of this famous woman, Carrington's statements, based upon his own direct observation, furnish for general reading perhaps a clearer version than can be had in any other account. The title of this book, published in 1909, is "Eusapia Palladino and her phenomena." It fairly represents Mr. Carrington's manner of writing, and makes plain his attitude toward mediumship.

The experiments with Palladino have large part also in a work by Cesare Lombroso, translated into English (1909) with the title "After death—what? Spiritistic phenomena and their interpretation." Leading over such fields as telepathy, clairvoyance and auto-suggestion, this treatise is of considerable importance. As may be expected (on account of the labors and numerous writings of this Italian author as a criminologist) the book "After death" is achieved in the manner of a scholar. It can be recommended only to those wishing to delve into considerations which are deep and thoughtful.

About the time of the early work of the British Society for Psychical Research, Henry Seybert, one of the benefactors of the University of Pennsylvania, made a request that this university should institute a formal examination of the claims of spiritualism. As a result, a commission, known as the Seybert commission, was appointed, and in 1887 a preliminary report of this body was published. In 1920, presumably on account of a revival of interest in psychic phenomena, the report was reprinted.

Because of the interest of the Stanfords in these matters, a similar work was undertaken at Leland Stanford

University. The department of psychology of the institution was here in charge of the investigation, and in 1917 a "Psychical research monograph" was published by the university, embodying the resultant study and observation.

The founders of such commissions are of course persons in sympathy with spiritistic ideas. The members of the investigating bodies, however, are quite likely to be individuals whose bent of mind has never led them to look into psychic phenomena prior to their appointment upon a "psychical committee" whose task is supposed to settle forever the truth or falsity of spirit communication. Proceedings undertaken in this way not only reveal reserve and caution, but almost indicate an atmosphere of unwillingness. Neither of the reports just cited carries very far toward such results as have been arrived at by the Society for Psychical Research, although at the date of the Stanford report the findings of psychical research had advanced to a point making it scarcely necessary to begin all over again. But while these studies have not brought conviction to the investigators, records of research work of this sort naturally afford excellent examples of scholarly criticism by non-spiritistic observers.

A volume in extremely dignified style, and not in the least designed as primary reading, is the translation (1917) of a work by P. M. J. Joire—"Psychical and supernormal phenomena; their observation and experimentation." This writer has been president of the Societe Universelle d'Etudes Psychiques, and what he has set down is both authoritative and conservative.

Another deeply instructive work, put forth by a serious and cultivated mind, is a book of 1908 entitled "New light on immortality," by E. E. Fournier d'Albe. This

author has lectured on scientific subjects in various British universities, and has held the office of honorable secretary of the Dublin section of the Society for Psychical Research. Such experiences as those of Sir William Crookes are carefully gone over in this volume, which presents the thoughtful comment occasioned by long and earnest study.

Charles Robert Richet, after more than a quarter century of investigation, still rejects spiritistic assumptions in a book published in 1923, although he admits that present-day science offers no explanation for many psychical happenings. In "Thirty years of psychical research, being a treatise on metapsychics," this author presents an array of information assembled during that length of time, relating many incidents and providing, in a volume of more than six hundred pages, a book useful for references purposes, despite its lack of close indexing. Richet, who has served as president of the British Society for Psychical Research in addition to being closely associated with psychical inquiry in his own country, holds the opinion that laws not yet understood by man will offer future explanation for a considerable number of the miracles of spirit phenomena.

In a work which was translated into English as long ago as 1910, Joseph Grasset undertook the explanation of some phases of spirit manifestation, admitting that other phenomena were beyond human understanding. This work is called "The marvels beyond science; being a record of progress in the reduction of occult phenomena to a scientific basis." Here are given many instances of psychic happenings, including such unusual occurrences as the transportation of objects from place to place, through walls, and so on.

Henry Frank, founder of the Metropolitan church of New York City, where for ten years he addressed large congregations, has been the author of several works showing extensive study yet presented in such language as not to discourage the average reader. Two of these books have chapters immediately concerned with psychic phenomena, besides considerable material bearing indirectly upon such questions. These volumes, appearing in 1909 and 1911, show caution, without entire acceptance of a spirit source as answerable for all forms of the manifestations considered. The earlier work is entitled "Modern light on immortality; being an original excursion into historical research and scientific discovery." The later book is a sequel, entitled "Psychic phenomena, science and immortality; being a further excursion into unseen realms beyond the point previously explored in 'Modern light on immortality.'"

"Evidence for a future life" is the title chosen for a work by Gabriel Delanne, which Helen A. Dallas in 1904 translated from the French, applying her own extensive knowledge of psychical subjects in framing and editing this material. Giving observation, experience and philosophical deduction, these considerations proceed upon a high level of thought. Something of the viewpoint of the author may be inferred from the closing words of the volume. "Such subjects," concludes Delanne, "open up a vista of progressive life...If these truths are sown broadcast they will inaugurate a moral and spiritual evolution which must finally culminate in the regeneration of humanity."

CHAPTER X

IN VARIED ASPECTS

In an attempt to group books concerned with spirit communication so that those having some form of similarity may be reckoned together, naturally a number of volumes are found which ally themselves with no particular class. The authors of some such works have been free lances, pursuing the study of spirit phenomena according to their own independent but none the less definite plan; others, through what would appear to be mere chance, have come into experiences of remarkable richness from a psychic standpoint. Presented variously, and proceeding from widely differing impulses, the following assortment of volumes comprises some of the most valuable items in psychical literature.

While modern interest in spiritualism was aroused in America at an earlier time than elsewhere, the strength of the movement when once started in England attained there a most vigorous growth. Not only for the publications of learned societies, but for a number of worthy books proceeding from individual experience, the literature of psychical science is indebted to English sources. Often the importance of psychic study has taken so deep a hold upon some serious-minded son of the British Isles, that the statements given forth leave no margin for question as to their sincerity.

A writer of this description was W. Osborne Moore, who in undertaking to present through published works the results of his seance experiences, has furnished records swept through by the force of dignity and

earnestness. The first of his volumes — "Glimpses of the next state" (1911)— was followed after an interval of a few years by "The voices," giving personal seance experiences of trumpet mediumship (whereby voices, proven to be distinct from the voice of the medium, are obtained in darkness or half light, the sounds being amplified by use of a megaphone, or trumpet).

Both books possess a certain human attribute, winning the reader to a liking for this author and a willingness to follow 'him in his visits to the seance-room. When mention is made that W. Osborne Moore carried the title of vice-admiral of the British Navy, some appreciation is reached as to the type of man — no gullible weakling, indeed—who has through these two volumes given the acknowledgment of his convictions regarding spirit phenomena.

Another extremely serious volume has come (1911) from Sir W. E. Cooper, whose long occupation with affairs of business in India failed to deter from the study of matters psychical. The title of this author's chief work is explicit enough to give an idea of the manner in which he has handled his subject: "Spiritual science, here and hereafter; a study of spiritual philosophy and its practical application to the everyday of life." The book will be found to hold a steady tone of confidence in the truth of spirit communication, and a solemn realization of the value of this knowledge to the morality of humankind.

A volume which has found favor with many readers is entitled "Claude's book." This consists of communications received through a medium in a series of regular seances or "sittings," extending over a period of two years. The mother of "Claude," Mrs. Kelway

Bamber, an Englishwoman, rightly concluded that by compiling in book form the messages thus received she might bring comfort to others who had suffered loss through the world war. For "Claude," a member of the Royal Flying Corps, fell in action in Flanders in 1915.

Further interest attaches to the book for the reason that the communications were received through "Fedra," the spirit controlling Mrs. Osborne Leonard. From the same source had come the principal communications from Raymond Lodge, and an introductory letter from Sir Oliver Lodge prefaces "Claude's book." That this record wove a bond of sympathy between the author and those into whose hands it came, was indicated by a demand which resulted in the publication of "Claude's second book."

Lucien Chase Graves, in his book "The natural order of spirit; a psychic study and experience," states that the preparation of the volume seemed a matter of compulsion, so great was the apparent urge causing this father to make public the messages received from a son.

Walter Lucien Graves, a student at Harvard Law School, was in 1911 the victim of a fatal railroad accident. The book in question presents messages given through a medium, and includes comments and conclusions interpolated by the parent.

Personal experiences of spirit communication are likewise given in Anna De Koven's book entitled "A cloud of witnesses." Mrs. De Koven, widow of the musical composer, Reginald De Koven, has here recorded messages received from her sister. No communications are given from the distinguished husband of the author, the volume having been constructed (1920) before his decease. The book was the first by this writer upon any matter concerned with psychical phenomena, although

she had put forth more than one work of fiction. Mrs. De Koven's ability to present her account brightly has added greatly to the staying power of this volume, and the messages she received were not without considerable value as evidence favoring the possibility of spirit communication.

The name of May Wright Sewall suggests to her compatriots a woman who has identified herself with works of education and intellectual advancement, in teaching and principalship, public lecturing, and as a suffragist leader. It can not but be admitted that in her interest in psychical science she displayed more credulity than might have been looked for in a person of her type. The book, "Neither dead nor sleeping" (1920) is an extensive account of her personal experience, evidencing an enthusiasm of belief in spirit possibilities which years of reflection might render more conservative.

Sophie Radford de Meissner a daughter of Rear Admiral Radford of the United States Navy, and widow of a Russian diplomat, has not refrained from making public her belief in spirit communication, and sometimes in newspaper columns she has afforded pungent data regarding prominent people who have reached her from the world of spirit. Her book "There are no dead" (1912) does not deal particularly with notables, however, and is merely a sincere effort to inform others of her findings, without attempt to polish the account in a literary sense.

Two books by Anne M. Robbins have had popularity with a considerable number of readers, since they consist of simply-told personal experiences with certain mediums, including some having celebrated names. "Both sides of the veil" (1909) and "Past and present

with Mrs. Piper" (1921) are the titles of this author's productions.

The psychic power of Mrs. Piper, and also of other mediums, forms the basis of a volume called "The evidence for communication with the dead," by Mrs. Anna Hude. This book was published in London in 1913, thus antedating the flood of spiritistic literature which followed the war-time period.

The title "How to speak with the dead; a practical handbook" (1918) might lead a novice to infer that some "short cut" to mediumship and even to actual conversation with spirits, is within the pale of possibility. However, the book, whose unknown author has chosen the pen name of "Sciens," is a popular outline of the ordinary methods of spirit manifestation, and will be found informative in a general way upon the philosophy and phenomena of spiritism.

Another anonymous book whose title hints at something of a more hair-raising nature than the content proves to be, is "A psychic vigil in three watches." This is a presentation covering the philosophy of spiritism in a chatty way, as a result of conversation among three average men, called Tom, Dick and Harry. The talk is supposedly carried on through an evening, although it comprises enough material for a much longer session. The book was originally privately printed in 1896, and prepared under the supervision of H. R. Haweis, clergyman and author, who has frequently shown interest in psychic investigation. An edition brought out in 1917 by a London publishing house afforded wider circulation.

The books of E. Katharine Bates comprise sketchy chapters upon her own psychical experience and that

of others. These are writings liked when weightier philosophical discussions do not meet a reader's needs. "Do the dead depart? and other questions" was followed by "Seen and unseen," and later (1917) by the volume entitled "Our living dead; some talks with unknown friends."

Under the title "The invisible guide" is paid a tribute to the alleged sustaining power and helpful influence of a spirit, who when in earth life had been a beloved friend of C. L. Hind, the author of the book. Going out of physical life while on a battle-field, the spirit in this instance is described as being able to appear and to convey, although without spoken words, his affection and some of his thoughts. Like some of the other accounts coming in the period following the world war, this volume lays particular stress upon the persistence of human affection after death.

Lilian Whiting's works are admired by readers who prefer a generalizing consideration of spirit phenomena rather than a succession of direct experiences. Touching but lightly on evidential instances, this author nevertheless argues steadily for a belief in spiritism. "The adventure beautiful" and "The spiritual significance" are titles indicating the trend of her efforts. "After her death" has to do with communications received from Kate Field, the brilliant journalist, with whom Lilian Whiting had been associated. A later volume (1919)—"They who understand" —includes such chapters as "The unbroken continuity of experience," and "The naturalness of the next phase of life." The manner of all of these books is that of gentle persuasion, in contrast to the lusty proclamation often characterizing spiritistic discoveries.

Another who in his writings frequently touches the fringe of the psychical, and occasionally gives in essay-like form definite indication of his researches in occult matters, is the Belgian dramatist, Maeterlinck. Although his contributions to psychical subjects have no more concern with particular instances of proof than have the writings of many less-known individuals, yet on account of his high place in literature these inclinations of Maeterlinck are not to be ignored. A translation of one of his works of this character was brought out in America in 1913 by two publishers, one selecting the title "Life after death," and the other "Our eternity."

Also, those who have read "The blue bird" are aware of the significance which psychical and occult science have had for this author. And all who have listened to the stage performance of this play, or have witnessed it in picturized form, will be likely to remember the query therein, "Where are the dead?" Then the answer, voicing Maeterlinck's own conviction — "There are no dead."

CHAPTER XI

ANOTHER VARIED GROUP

Psychical research in recent years has brought forward evidence held by many as of a more convincing nature than any previously arrived at — through what is known as "cross correspondence." A cross correspondence is had when two mediums, receiving fragmentary and incoherent spirit communications, find that these separate incomprehensible bits fit together to form a complete, clear statement. Frequently the result is a sentence or a succession of paragraphs of the most abstruse content. The indication is that such a communication can only be produced on account of two spirit intelligences cooperating to transmit the sentences little by little (a few words to one medium, then the next few to the other). Thus the spirits, apparently, simultaneously dictate to two mediums, somewhat in the form of a code letter. The fact that this cross correspondence method originated on the spirit side of life makes all of this especially evidential in behalf of spirit survival. Further, according to correlative explanations received from spirit sources under supervision of the Society for Psychical Research, certain deceased members of that society achieved these marvelous results in an effort to aid in the work in which they had been active when in earth life.

In a small book published in 1920 entitled "The ear of Dionysius," the Right Honorable Gerald William Balfour discusses a certain cross correspondence dealing with classical material and beyond the ability of an ordinary medium to evolve. Considerable previous study

of psychical subjects, coupled with a liking for the deep places in classical literature, is essential to an appreciation of this, and the book is not recommended for the casual reader. Cross correspondences, however, are described in some of the larger recent treatises on spiritism, and of course have place in the publications of the Society for Psychical Research.

Helen A. Dallas, of England, is the author of a number of books concerned with spiritualism. For preparing a statement, "Objections to spiritualism answered," she received favorable notice from those who have studied these problems long and deeply. "Across the barrier," is the title of another work from the same writer, while "Death, the gate of life," published in England as "Mors janua vitae," deals with certain messages purporting to have come from F. W. H. Myers. While this attempt at communication with Myers secured material of value to experienced researchers, the success of the experiment was not overwhelming. To many students these messages will seem far-fetched and complex, being in the form of cross correspondence.

Not all spiritualists would be willing to concede the probability of holding converse with a succession of spirits who when in earth life had been people of great distinction. But perhaps such possibilities are no more wonderful than present radio achievements, instantly bringing the word spoken at a given center to all who are able to get into proper vibration. At any rate, Dr. Albert Durrant Watson, a practicing physician and a former president of the Association of Psychical Research for Canada, believed that communications received under his observation often came from departed celebrities. Two books have been published by him, based on messages and addresses spoken in trance by

Mr. Louis Benjamin, a young medium. "The twentieth plane, a psychic revelation," appeared in 1919, followed by a volume entitled "Birth through death, the ethics of the twentieth plane." The subject-matter, taken down by amanuenses and compiled by Doctor Watson, together with the latter's description of some of the experiences, furnishes reading likely to open new avenues of thought.

Hiram Corson, long a professor at Cornell University, the author of a number of books on the study of literature, and an authority on the works of Robert Browning, revealed his interest in spirit phenomena in a single volume called "Spirit messages." This soon disappeared from the bookselling mart, possibly on account of the author's high educational associations. But upon his death in 1911 the book was at once reprinted by a spiritualistic publisher.

Lively and evidential personal seances with various mediums have been fluently described in a book of 1920 called "Spirit life; or, Do we die?" This is by William Dunseath Eaton, a Chicagoan whose newspaper and literary connections have also led him out into other noteworthy activities. These pages, with occasional allusions to well-remembered people, and with bits of local color, will be particularly appreciated by Chicago residents, aside from the spiritistic setting. Originally founding the Chicago *Herald*, which somehow slipped out of his grasp after a brief successful period, Mr. Eaton records that this experience of rise and fall had been predicted by a medium. The success or otherwise of certain plays of Eaton's authorship had also been foretold, nor were the foregoing the only prophecies made to him and fulfilled. This author has been led not only to belief in after-death continuity, but in proceeding

to the frontiers of the reincarnation theory, presents readably considerable material for reflection.

A "book test," in the language of the seance room, consists in the location by spirit messages, according to page and line, or in some similar definite way, of a quotation in print. It is presumed that the circumstances preclude the knowledge, by the recipient of the message and by the medium, as to the facts of the exact occurrence of the quoted matter. Therefore, if the information turns out to be correct, it is concluded that the experience proves the action of a disembodied intelligence. Rev. Stainton Moses, that celebrated medium of a former generation, received very wonderful and veridical book tests, and in recent years this manner of obtaining evidence forms the basis of more than one book. "The earthen vessel, a volume dealing with spirit communication in the form of book-tests," gives a considerable record of messages of this sort. This account (1921) has been compiled from the experience of a titled Englishwoman, Baroness Pamela Glenconner.

(Another discussion of book test experiences is that of Rev. Charles Drayton Thomas, mentioned herein in the chapter "The interested clergy.")

"The church and psychical research, a layman's view" (1921) takes the ground that the Christian creeds can not recognize spiritualism as a religion, but that the idea of communication with the departed should not be frowned upon as evil or denounced as rubbish. G. E. Wright, the author of this and other books concerned with psychical research, argues for the importance of investigation of spirit phenomena, pressing the point that "while we can never scale the heights of divine knowledge, we can use the equipment which is ours to-day to survey the foothills."

This same English author has put together in a light manner for general reading a resume of the advance of psychical research, entitled "Practical views on psychic phenomena." For readers who do not care to undertake the perusal of any of the extended or extremely scientific surveys of psychical knowledge, popular reviews, such as the foregoing, afford a sweeping glance at the subject.

Another excellent general review, constructed in a manner for the ordinary reader not caring to proceed into deep studies, is the translation from the French (1920) of a work by L. Chevreuil, entitled "Proofs of the spirit world."

In "Psychical research for the plain man," an English publication of 1920, Miss S. Al. Kingsford states that she undertook to act as interpreter between the learned societies and the every-day citizen, and attempted to reproduce in intelligible form the evidence that spirit manifestations occur. This book recounts instances and gives a digest of the comments made by experts of the British Society for Psychical Research.

Prof. William Jackson Crawford, of Queen's University, Belfast, has attempted to put to the test of physical proof the phenomena of mediumship and psychic manifestation. In this line of endeavor, Crawford has indeed gone far, seeking with perseverance to solve the nature of psychic force, the facts concerning the remarkable substance known as "ectoplasm," and the probable details of action during the production of certain phenomena. In a book (1918) entitled "The reality of psychic phenomena, raps, levitations, etc." this scientist has given the result of continued experimentation. As may be expected, such material constitutes technical reading.

In "Hints and observations for those investigating the phenomena of spiritism," Professor Crawford has done

no more than to compile generally-known facts, but this handbook will be useful to beginners. "The psychic structures at the Goligher circle" deals with materializations possible through the power of a Belfast family named Goligher, the chief medium being a young woman —Miss Kathleen Goligher.

While alluding to works upon the observation of physical manifestations, the great book of A. P. F. Schrenck-Notzing must be mentioned, although its cost places it beyond the reach of an ordinary pocketbook and strikes it from the list of an average public library. The book was published in German in 1913, and in 1920 was translated into English by E. E. Fournier d'Albe, (himself a celebrated follower of psychic research and an author upon psychical subjects). Bearing the title "Phenomena of materialisation; a contribution to the investigation of mediumistic teleplastics," it goes into the study of many instances of spirit materialization and describes experiments personally conducted by the author. The volume covers over three hundred pages, and numerous plates add to the clarity and value of the descriptions. Over two hundred photographs were taken by flashlight, in the course of these researches, and in one experiment nine cameras were exposed at one time at various angles. The principal mediums whose work was observed by this German scholar were two young women who submitted to all manner of tests without any compensation for their time or services.

Before translation made available Schrenck-Notzing's book, brief remarks upon its contents were given by Gambier Bolton, in an appendix to a work published in England in 1914, called "Ghosts in solid form." Mr. Bolton has been a lecturer before the Royal Society, and has served as president of the Psychological Society of

London. His book comprises chiefly his own startling experiments at obtaining materialization through various mediums and under his own test conditions. In one section of his account are given answers to questions asked of spirits. The volume as a whole is of exceptional interest.

Fresh and vigorous in construction, and to the average mind compellingly attractive, is a book published in 1917 entitled "The dead have never died." The author, E. C. Randall, is a lawyer of the city of Buffalo. Citing experiences and setting forth philosophic teachings deduced therefrom, this author's sentences seem to have been lashed into liveliness by the urge of his deepest convictions. This is one of the very best books with which to make first contact of the subject of spirit survival. A later volume by Mr. Randall—"Frontiers of the after life"—has not duplicated the flash of the author's first avowal. If any sizable library lacks "The dead have never died," the omission is regrettable, as in a community having the least liking for such subjects the book is certain to be popular. It is a volume to lend—to give—to recommend.

The management of the *Scientific American*, following the after-war interest in spirit phenomena, offered an award of \$2500 to any medium who would satisfy the requirements of an investigating committee appointed by the magazine. After many seances had been held, a non-professional medium, Mrs. L. G. Crandon, wife of a Boston surgeon, succeeded in proving to some members of the committee the genuineness of phenomena occurring through her power. Since the committee failed to vote unanimously in her favor, the award was not made. The story of this investigation is given by J. Malcolm Bird, managing editor of the *Scientific American*

can, in a 1925 book called "Margery: the medium" ("Margery" being the pseudonym of Mrs. Crandon, the highly gifted medium under consideration).

"My psychic adventures" (1923) is another interesting contribution by Mr. Bird.

In years past there have been published a few spiritualistic works devoted to the subject of healing by spirit power. Most of these have been merely theoretical and but remotely connected with evidence for survival, and some of them are now out of print. But it is possible to point to one remarkable book upon this phase of spiritism—a volume brought out in recent years and hence readily obtainable. This is the tale of the cure of a woman bedridden for fifteen years. The book, originally published in England in 1918, aroused comment in medical journals there. The English edition bore the title "One thing I know; or, The power of the unseen." Published two years later in America, the title then assigned was "The unseen doctor." The author—the woman who underwent this miraculous healing experience—is named only by the initials "E. M. S."

The book relates the story of restoration to health through aid of the spirit of a departed physician. The account of the personal bedside visits of this spirit physician, and the treatment given, is told in a manner to rivet the attention. To the ailing this declaration presents encouragement in an entirely new guise, while to all students of psychic phenomena such a statement can scarcely fail to appeal as a document both important and vivid.

A book of 1925, "Thirty years among the dead," by A. Wickland and others, has importance in throwing light upon conditions of obsession and insanity.

CHAPTER XII

BOOKS TO SIT UP ALL NIGHT TO READ

A certain few of the books dealing with psychical phenomena are possessed of extraordinary popular appeal, sometimes because of the especial knack of particular authors in transcribing into vivid language the marvels they have heard recounted or the thrills they themselves have felt. These are like garden-rows of color against the more sober psychical landscape—set there by hearts aglow with enthusiasm to celebrate the different new joy proceeding from their outreaching discoveries.

First published as long ago as 1848, and having been in demand through edition after edition from that time until the present, "The night side of nature; or, Ghosts and ghost seers" is a record of innumerable instances of all manner of psychic phenomena. The author, Mrs. Catherine Stevens Crowe, a highly educated Englishwoman, had been a deep student of psychic occurrences, and the mention she has given is no hingeing together of unfounded yarns. Her sparkling manner of description has made fascinating reading out of these phenomenal happenings, leaving the reader breathless as one item follows another—each seemingly more remarkable than its predecessor.

Another famous book of earlier days came from the pen of Florence Marryat (Mrs. Lean) a daughter of Captain Marryat, whose sea stories are old favorites. Inheriting her father's literary facility, this writer was successful with works of fiction, some of which bore the

flavor of psychical ideas. But no volume she put forth has been more widely known than the one entitled "There is no death." In this Florence Marryat gave brilliant citation to countless instances of psychic experience, indicating forcefully her realization of the importance of spirit phenomena, and creating pages hard to put aside when once their spell has seized upon the mind.

Hamlin Garland, whose fiction has long held place in American literature, in 1908 wrote entertainingly of certain personal seance experiences in a book called "The shadow world." This is not of extended length, and runs along in a lively way to lead a reader on and on. Moreover, since it comprises some apexes of excitement, it is fair to predict that many a one will devour this book at a single sitting.

The title "Are the dead alive?" indicates that its author, A. Fremont Rider, had a first-rate idea of how to challenge attention, and even a cursory examination of this book will give the impression that there is here exhibited an especial talent in the arrangement of material. (Indeed, this collection of psychic phenomena is not the only work in which Mr. Rider employed ability in selecting and formulating salient points, since the best guidebook to New York City carries his name as foremost compiler).

Published as long ago as 1909, and chiefly reviewing the notable psychic experiences of eminent persons, the amplified title of the book is: "Are the dead alive? The problem of psychic research that the world's leading scientists are trying to solve and the progress they have made." It is well written, sensibly planned, and carries excellent illustrations. This is a record characterized by a power of fascination sufficient to keep the average

person occupied until far beyond any usual hour of retiring.

Few spiritualistic books, except those dealing definitely with art or photography, are enlivened by profuse illustrations. The appeal of the picture in adding power to a book on spirit communication must have been held as a central idea by Mr. George Henslow, author of "The proofs of the truths of spiritualism" (1919). Having assembled and brought into coherence a wealth of brief quotations from a wide range of authorities, Mr. Henslow interspersed throughout this array of facts half a hundred plates and smaller cuts. The result, of course, is that the person who picks up such a volume is likely to continue to turn pages in forgetfulness of the clock.

A book of considerable length, based on rather extended observation, is "The widow's mite," and other psychic phenomena," by Isaac K. Funk. The character of the author and the nature of his experience combine with his easy manner of narration to form a particularly enthralling account. Doctor Funk was head and founder of the world-known publishing firm of Funk & Wagnalls, and the book in question takes title from an experience of the author in the routine of his publishing work. To furnish an illustration for the "Standard dictionary" there had been loaned to Doctor Funk by Henry Ward Beecher, a coin called a "widow's mite." This valuable curio becoming mislaid, it was recovered through information given by a spirit, and the book, which was published as long ago as 1904, consists of the story of all this, and other psychical adventures.

In a less noted but nevertheless readable book called "The psychic riddle," the same author has recorded further investigations; but "The widow's mite" remains

his chief volume—delightfully written from a fund of lively experience. Doctor Funk was neither a worker in the ranks of spiritualists nor was he closely associated with any concerted movement of psychical research. Pursuing his investigations alone, he still wished to share widely the results which had proved of interest to himself. Having the faculty of projecting his personality into what he wrote, he has demonstrated that quality which makes a book living, companionable and human. The emotions this writer and publisher knew will find frequent response among those who select "The widow's mite" as reading—while half-hours stretch into hours of absorbed attention.

Violet Tweedale, known as a British novelist, has increased the list of psychical books with one of the sort whose pages occasion a most delicious succession of gasps and chills. "Ghosts I have seen, and other psychic experiences" (1919) is a title to convey some notion of the sensations lying between its covers. The author, a granddaughter of Robert Chambers, of the famous publishing house of that name, has had abundant opportunity to meet celebrated personages and gather from them all the psychical accounts they had within memory. To these she has added her own very remarkable experiences, touching the whole with the flame of her ardent liking for discoverable psychic truth and unsolved psychic mystery.

The result certainly is a gripping composite of material, and it may well be chosen by one who loves such topics and wishes to have the toll of the midnight hour startle the brain with its sudden arrival and touch the spinal column with a portentous icy creeping.

CHAPTER XIII

A TRIO OF TREMENDOUS WORKS

The investigations of the British Society for Psychical Research have afforded the basis for not a few of the volumes already listed in the present sketch of the literature of continuity. And two of the following three stupendous works—all great in length and monumental in importance—rear their structure upon foundations laid by activities of organized psychical research.

One of these great productions, of comparatively recent publication, is the work of Henry Holt, head of the publishing house bearing his name. In its latest edition (that of 1919) this is entitled "The cosmic relations and immortality," an edition of 1914 having appeared under the title "On the cosmic relations." In point of extent, the work runs through two octavo volumes, or over a thousand pages in all. As for its manner—even such portions as deal with the theory of evolution or the deep considerations of "cosmic consciousness" are written in the same brisk conversational style prevailing in the entire recital. Without hint of egotism, the personality of this author inserts itself into his lines, making felt the radiance of a kindly disposition, with an unflinching sense of humor, a sane perception of the importance of his theme, and an admitted personal conviction that these wonders of which he writes are but manifestations of the law of life.

Following introductory generalizations, the remainder of the work is filled with psychic experiences. Some of these came about from the author's personal investigations, and some are quoted from the Proceedings of

the Society for Psychical Research. Since this treatise was constructed in recent years, it takes account of the newer psychical experiments and discoveries, such as, for example, "cross correspondence" and its signification.

Moreover, as the work carries a full index, its value for reference purposes is considerable, whether or not the full Proceedings of the Society for Psychical Research are available. And from beginning to end these volumes are brightened by a running fire of piquant comment. It may be freely said that there is not a dull page in them, despite their forbidding size and awe-inspiring title.

Camille Flammarion, the French astronomer, long included among those with a liking for psychical knowledge, during the past quarter-century has published several volumes recording his investigations and reflections concerning these matters. With unflagging patience and continued eagerness to arrive at truth, it has been Flammarion's practice to invite written statements of psychic experiences. These have been sent to him by thousands. From this extensive collection a few hundred have been chosen for inclusion in the great work of his later years, entitled "Death and its mystery," which comprises three volumes and sets down whatever of personal experience or of happenings to others has seemed to the author significant in relation to the continuity of life.

All of Flammarion's writings are in scientific language and spirit-reading to be undertaken when the mind is fresh, rather than as a diversion for an idle hour. Even the book "Haunted houses," brought out in 1924, is in very dignified vein, giving a great many instances of such occurrences, and shaping a sequence of ghostly narratives to be taken seriously, and not merely as pastime. Among earlier works, "The unknown," published in

1900, and "Mysterious psychic forces," in 1906, were speedily translated into English. So also was the larger work on "Death," translation of which appeared in 1921-23. The volume titles of the latter work are as follows: (1) "Before death; proofs of the existence of the soul;" (2) "At the moment of death; manifestations and apparitions of the dying; doubles; phenomena of occultism;" (3) "After death; manifestations and apparitions of the dead; the soul after death."

This very extensive consideration of the subject, which Flammarion states to be the result of half a century of study and observation, has an especial importance aside from its length and its general content—proceeding from the fact that the author has, since the publication of his previous volumes, been brought to the realization "that the soul is independent of the material organism, and continues to live on after death." At no time prejudiced in mind, yet never willing to concede without a preponderance of evidence, Flammarion in his earlier works went no farther than to admit the existence of the soul as an independent entity, to acknowledge the reality of telepathy, and to set forth the fact that certain psychic powers exist which are little understood.

To these assertions he has now added his complete persuasion that existence continues after death, as proven by spirit manifestation. He has reached, he affirms, the assured conclusion that "death is the portal of life—*mors janua vitae*."

As early as 1896, Frederic W. H. Myers, working upon the dissertation entitled "Human personality and its survival of bodily death," arranged with Dr. Richard Hodgson that the latter should complete the publication of this material in the event of Myers' death before the task should be finished. Many of the chapters were in press when, in 1901, the time came for Myers to put

aside his pen and go forward into that other life whose reality he had so faithfully tried to prove.

Miss Alice Johnson, of Newnham College, Cambridge, having had supervision of the proof sheets, was able to be of great service to Doctor Hodgson in the completion of the volumes, to which undertaking Hodgson brought his own wealth of experience. Indeed, although he left no book of his own, Doctor Hodgson was credited among his associates with having an acuteness of intellect exceeding any of them in grasp of the general principles underlying spirit phenomena. Noted for his detection and exposition of fraud, this man had finally emerged as an enthusiastic spiritist. Further, in addition to his superior mental gifts, Doctor Hodgson had a warmth of affection for Myers. Despite the fact that the portions of the book left unfinished by Myers had to be written and pieced together from notes, the volumes were speedily brought to publication (in 1903). In certain respects no similar production has surpassed them.

Myers had approached the preparation of his great work equipped with unusual scholarship, exceptional mastery of English, and a yearning to coordinate in systematized form and give to the world the knowledge reached by research in psychical fields. Through chapters upon such subjects as "Sleep," "Genius," and "Hypnotism," he dealt with the action of the mind variously considered, proceeding then to the conditions of trance and clairvoyance. Extensive appendixes are replete with illustrative incidents, these citations of experience thus being kept apart from the smoothness of the running text.

A syllabus of each chapter gives guidance to the entire contents, a very full index also being provided. By reason of the extent, completeness and arrangement of

these two large volumes (of 700 and 660 pages respectively) they form a reference work of the greatest value where such subjects are likely to be consulted. An abridged edition in a single volume has also been published, but the pruning process very naturally affected much of the beauty of expression found in the original.

As an essayist, Myers had won high place prior to his resolve to undertake such a voluminous piece of writing as the foregoing. His psychical chapters are often essay-like—an atmosphere of classical scholarship so prevailing therein that they are ever a source of cultural inspiration. When taking into consideration the achievement of arranging material of this sort and sustaining a single idea through volumes of such length and quality of literary accomplishment, it can be said that no work in psychical literature surpasses this.

The life of F. W. H. Myers thus illustrates the consummation of a desired purpose. He was among those under whose incentive the Society for Psychical Research was founded, and nothing devised as allurements ever turned him aside from the pursuit of information regarding existence beyond the grave. Searching primarily for this knowledge to satisfy his own queries, the wish strengthened within him to make known to mankind all that might be discoverable as psychical reality. It has been stated that there was no goal which Myers coveted equally with the one which he attained—of presenting in polished and flawless clarity a fact which he held to merit a shining place in the coronet of truth: the fact of Human Survival

SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY OF SPIRIT PHENOMENA

The following list is made up of books in print in America in 1925 adapted to the comprehension of an average reader and popularly priced. Full titles and data indicating the character of these volumes (with other writings, if any, by the same authors) are included in the foregoing text and may be located through the index.

- Bamber, Mrs. L. K. (ed.). *Claude's book*. N. Y., Holt, 1919. 136 p. \$1.60.
- Barker, Elsa. *Letters from a living dead man*. N. Y., Kennerly, 1914. 291 p. \$1.25.
- Barrett, Sir W. F. *On the threshold of the unseen*. N. Y., Dutton, 1917. 336 p. \$3.00.
- Cameron, Margaret. *The seven purposes*. N. Y., Harper, 1918. 313 p. \$2.25.
- Chambers, Arthur. *Our life after death*. N. Y., Jacobs, 1899. 275 p. \$1.50.
- Comstock, W. C. *A psychical experience*. Bost., Badger, 1923. 126 p. \$1.50.
- Crawford, W. J. *The reality of psychic phenomena*. N. Y., Dutton, 1918. 246 p. \$2.00.
- De Koven, A. F. *A cloud of witnesses*. N. Y., Dutton, 1920. 273 p. \$3.00.
- Doyle, Sir A. C. *The new revelation*. N. Y., Doran, 1918. 122 p. \$1.00.
- Funk, I. K. *The widow's mite*. N. Y., Funk, 1904. 538 p. \$3.00.
- Garland, Hamlin. *The shadow world*. N. Y., Harper, 1908. 294 p. \$2.00.
- Geldert, G. D. B. *Thy son liveth*. Bost., Little, 1918. 84 p. \$1.00.
- Henslow, George. *The proofs of the truths of spiritualism*. N. Y., Dodd, 1919. 254 p. \$2.50.
- Herbine, C. G. (comp.). *The meeting of the spheres*. N. Y. Brentano's, 1919. 316 p. \$3.00.
- Hill, J. A. *Spiritualism, its history, phenomena and doctrine*. N. Y., Doran, 1919. 316 p. \$2.25.
- Hyslop, J. H. *Life after death*. N. Y., Dutton, 1918. 339 p. \$2.50.

- Kingsford, S. M. *Psychical research for the plain man*. N. Y., Dutton, 1920. 271 p. \$2.50.
- Lane, A. W. and H. S. Beale. *To walk with God*. N. Y., Dodd, 1920. 120 p. \$1.25.
- Leaf, Horace. *What is this spiritualism?* N. Y., Doran, 1919. 185 p. \$1.50.
- Lodge, Sir O. J. *The survival of man*. N. Y., Doran, 1920. 379 p. \$3.00. (New, enlarged edition; original edition published in 1909).
- McKenzie, J. H. *Spirit intercourse*. N. Y., Kennerly, 1917. 295 p. \$1.50.
- Marryat, Florence. *There is no death*. N. Y., McKay, 1920. (New ed.). 265 p. \$1.25.
- Randall, E. C. *The dead have never died*. N. Y., Knopf, 1917. 262 p. \$2.50.
- Raupert, J. G. F. *Modern spiritism*. St. Louis, Herder, 1909. 261 p. \$1.25.
- S., E. M. *The unseen doctor*. N. Y., Holt, 1920. 142 p. \$1.75.
- Smith, H. T. *Voices from the void*. N. Y., Dutton, 1919. 164 p. \$2.00.
- Stead, W. T. *After death*. N. Y., Doran, 1918. 204 p. \$1.50.
- Stoddart, J. T. *The case against spiritualism*. N. Y., Doran, 1919. 171 p. \$1.50.
- Tweedale, Violet. *Ghosts I have seen*. N. Y., Stokes, 1919. 312 p. \$2.00.
- Wright, G. E. *The church and psychical phenomena*. N. Y., Dutton, 1921. 147 p. \$1.60.

INDEX TO AUTHORS AND TITLES

Abolishing of death. King.....	50	Contact with the other world.	
Across the barrier. Dallas.....	72	Hyslop.....	17
Adventure beautiful. Whiting.....	69	Cooper, Sir W. E.....	65
After death. Stead.....	46	Corson, H.....	73
After death—what? Lombroso.....	60	Cosmic relations and 'immortality.....	
After her death. Whiting.....	69	Holt.....	83
All the spiritualism of the Bible. Sprague. . .	41	Crawford, W. J.....	75
American Society for Psychical.....		Crookes, Sir W.....	19, 20
Research.....	15	Crowe, C. S.....	13, 79
Are the dead alive? Rider.....	80	Dallas, H. A.....	72
Balfour, G. W.....	71	Davis, A. J.....	11
Bamber, Mrs. L. K.....	65	De Koven, A.....	66
Barker, E.....	47	Dead have never died. Randall.....	77
Barrett, Sir W. F.....	15	Dearmer, N. K.....	51
Bates, E. K.....	68	Death and its mystery. Flammarion.....	
Bennett, E. T.....	17	84
Bird, J. M.....	78	Death, the gate of life. Dallas.....	72
Birth through death. Watson.....	73	Debatable land between this world.....	
Bolton, G.....	76	and the next. Owen.....	12
Bond, F. B.....	49	Delanne, G.....	63
Both sides of the veil. Robbins.....	67	Do the dead depart? Bates.....	69
Britten, E. H.....	27	Doyle, Sir A. C.....	22
Bugle. Hicks.....	52	Ear of Dionysius. Balfour.....	71
Cadwallader, M. E.....	31	Earthen vessel. Glenconner.....	74
Cameron, M.....	47	Eaton, W. D.....	73
Can telepathy explain? Savage.....	41	Edmonds, J. W. and G. T. Dexter.....	9
Carrington, H.....	59	Encyclopedia of Biblical spiritualism....	
Case against spiritualism. Stoddard.....	35	Hull.....	40
Chambers, A.....	39	Epworth phenomena. Wright.....	38
Chevreuil, L.....	75	Eusapia Palladino and her phenomena..	
Church and psychical research. Wright.....	74	Carrington.....	60
Claude's book. Bamber.....	65	Evidence for a future life. Delanne.....	63
Claude's second book. Bamber.....	66	Evidence for communication with the ...	
Clodd, E.....	33	dead. Hude.....	68
Cloud of witnesses. DeCoven.....	66	Fellowship of the picture. Dearmer.....	51
Coates, J.....	29	Flammarion, C.....	84
Colville, W. J.....	31	Footfalls on the boundary of another....	
Coming of the fairies. Doyle.....	24	world. Owen.....	12
Comstock, W. C.....	50	Fournier d'Albe, E. E.....	61
Concerning spiritualism. Massey.....	26	Frank, H.....	63

Frontiers of the after life. Randall	77	Joire, P. M. J.	61
Funk, I. K.	81	King, B.	50
Garland, H.	80	Kingsford, S. M.	75
Gate of remembrance. Bond	50	Lane, A. W. and H. B. Beale	52
Geldert, G. D. B.	57	Last letters of the living dead man. Barker ...	47
Ghosts I have seen. Tweedale	82	Law of psychic phenomena. Hudson	37
Ghosts in solid form. Bolton	76	Leadbeater, C. W.	36
Glenconner, P.	74	Leaf, H.	28
Glimpses of the next state. Moore	65	Leland Stanford junior University	60
God's smile. Magnussen	56	Letters from a living dead man. Barker	47
Gone west. Grove and Hunt	55	Letters from Doctor Coulter. Herbine	54
Grasset, J.	62	Letters from Harry and Helen. White	56
Graves, L. C.	66	Letters from Julia. Stead	46
Great harmonia. Davis	11	Letters from Roy. Stevens	56
Grove, H. M. and M. M. Hunt	55	Life after death. Hyslop	16
Guide to mediumship. Wallis	30	Life after death. Maeterlinck	70
Hardy, T. J.	35	Life beyond the veil. Owen	42, 54
Hare, R.	10	Life in the circles. Lane and Beale	52
Haunted houses Flammarion	84	Liljencrants, J.	36
Henslow, G.	81	Lodge, Sir O. J.	19
Herbine, C. G.	53	Lombroso, C.	60
Heysinger, I. W.	58	Longley, M. T.	31
Hicks, B. B.	52	M. A. Oxon., pseud.	38
Hill, J. A.	27	McEville, M. A.	51
Hill of vision. Bond	50	McKenzie, J. H.	29
Hind, C. L.	69	Maeterlinck, M.	70
Hints and observations for those investigating the phenomena of spiritism. Crawford ..	75	Magician among the spiritualists. Houdini ...	34
History of the supernatural. Howitt	12	Magnussen, J.	56
Holt, H.	83	Man is a spirit. Hill	27
Houdini, H., pseud.	34	Man's survival after death. Tweedale	43
How to speak with the dead. Sciens	68	Margery: the medium. Bird	78
Howitt, W.	12	Marryat, F.	79
Hude, A.	68	Marvels beyond science. Grasset.	62
Hudson, T. J.	37	Massey, G.	26
Hull, M.	40	Maxwell, J.	58
Human personality and its survival of		Mediumship. Tuttle	30
bodily death. Myers	85	Meeting of the spheres. Herbine	53
Hyslop, J. H.	16	Meissner, S. R. de	67
I heard a voice	54	Meslom's messages. McEville	51
If a man die, shall he live again? Clodd ...	33	Metaphysical phenomena. Maxwell	58
Invisible guide. Hind	69	Modern light on immortality. Frank	63
James, W.	14	Modern spiritism. Raupert	35
		Moore, W. U.	64

Mors janua vitae. Dallas.....	72	Psychic phenomena, science and	
Moses, S.....	38, 43, 74	immortality. Frank.....	53
My psychic adventures. Bird.....	78	Psychic riddle. Funk.....	81
Myers, F. W. H.....	85	Psychic structures at the Goligher circle. ...	
Mysterious psychic forces. Flammarion	85	Crawford.....	76
Natural order of spirit. Graves.....	66	Psychic vigil in three watches.....	68
Neither dead nor sleeping. Sewall	67	Psychical and supernormal phenomena.....	
New light immortality. Fournier d'Albe	61	Joire.....	61
New revelation. Doyle	23, 24	Psychical experience. Comstock.....	51
Newer spiritualism. Podmore	59	Psychical investigation. Hill	27
Night side of nature. Crowe	13, 79	Psychical research and survival. Hyslop.....	17
Nineteenth century miracles. Britten.....	26	Psychical research for the plain man.....	
Objections to spiritualism answered.....		Kingsford.....	75
Dallas.....	72	Psychical research monograph.....	
On miracles & modern spiritualism		Leland Stanford junior University	61
Wallace.....	20	Psychosophy. Richmond.....	31
On the cosmic relations. Holt.....	83	Quest for Dean B.Connor. Philpott	37
On the threshold of the unseen. Barrett	15	Randall, E. C.....	77
One thing I know. E. M. S.....	78	Raupert, J. G. F.....	35
Other side of death. Leadbeater	36	Raymond. Lodge	21
Ould, F. F.....	42	Reality of psychic phenomena. Crawford...	75
Our eternity. Maeterlinck.....	70	Richet, C. R.	62
Our life after death. Chambers.....	40	Richmond, C. L. V.....	31
Our living dead. Bates	69	Rider, A. F.....	80
Our unseen guest	52	Robbins, A. M.....	67
Owen, G. V.....	42, 54	Rupert lives! Wynn	43
Owen, R. D.....	12	S. E. M.....	78
Past & present with Mrs. Piper. Robbins..	67	Sargent, E.....	28
Patience Worth. Yost.....	48	Savage, M. J.....	41
Pennsylvania, University of	60	Schrenck-Notzing, A. P. F.....	76
Phenomena of materialisation.....		Sciens, pseud.....	68
Schrenck-Notzing.....	76	Scientific basis of spiritualism. Sargent.....	28
Philpott, A. J.....	37	Seeing the invisible. Coates	29
Photographing the invisible. Coates	29	Seen and unseen. Bates	69
Podmore, F.	59	Seven purposes. Cameron.....	47
Practical views of psychic phenomena.		Sewall, M. W.....	67
Wright.....	75	Seybert commission: Preliminary report...	
Principles of nature. Davis.....	11	University of Pennsylvania.....	60
Private Dowding.....	53	Shadow world. Garland.....	80
Proofs of the spirit world. Chevreuil	75	Smith, H. T.....	54
Proofs of the truths of spiritualism.....		Society for Psychical Research.....	14
Henslow	81	Some new evidence for human survival.....	
Psychic phenomena. Bennett.....	17	Thomas.....	43

Spirit and matter before the bar of modern science. Hoy	58	Thy son liveth. Geldert	56
Spirit intercourse. McKenzie.....	29	To walk with God. Lane and Beale.....	52
Spirit life. Eaton.....	73	To woman from Meslom. McEvilly	51
Spirit messages. Corson.....	73	Tuttle, H.	30
Spiritism and religion. Liljencrants	36	Tweedale, C.L.	43
Spiritism in the light of the faith. Hardy ...	35	Tweedale, V.....	82
Spiritual science, here and hereafter		Twentieth plane. Watson	73
Cooper.....	65	Unknown, The. Flammarion	84
Spiritual significance. Whiting	69	Unseen doctor. E. M. S.....	78
Spiritualism. Edmonds and Dexter.....	9	Vital message. Doyle	23
Spiritualism. Hill	27	Voices, The. Moore.....	65
Spiritualism scientifically demonstrated....		Voices from the void. Smith	54
Hare	10	Wallace, A. R.....	20
Sprague, E. W.....	41	Wallis, E. W. and M. H.....	30
Stead, W. T.....	46	War letters of the living dead	
Stevens, L. H.....	56	man. Barker.....	47
Stoddart, J. T.....	35	Watson, A. D.....	72
Survival of man. Lodge	20	What is this spiritualism? Leaf	28
Tallmadge, N. P.....	9	White, M. B.	55
There are no dead. Meissner.....	67	Whiting, L.....	69
There is no death. Marryat.....	80	Wickland, C.....	78
They who understand. Whiting	69	Widow's mite. Funk.....	81
Thirty years among the dead. Wickland.....	78	Wonders of the saints in the	
Thirty years of psychical re search.....		light of spiritualism. Ould.....	42
Richet.....	62	Wright, D.	38
Thomas, C. D.....	43	Wright, G. E.....	74
Thought for help. Comstock.....	51	Wynn, W.....	42
		Yost, C. S.....	48

